

HOW WESTERN MISSIONARIES CAN SUCCESSFULLY ENTRUST THEIR WORK TO
DEVELOPING WORLD INDIGENOUS LEADERS SO THE NATIONAL CHURCH
BECOMES SELF-SUPPORTING, SELF-PROPAGATING AND SELF-GOVERNING

A THESIS-PROJECT
SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF
GORDON-CONWELL THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE
DOCTOR OF MINISTRY

BY
JEAN MAXIME PIERRE-PIERRE

MAY 2020

CONTENTS

ILLUSTRATIONS	v
ABSTRACT.....	vi
1. THE THREE-SELF CONCEPT AS APPLIED TO DEVELOPING WORLD CHURCHES....	1
Introduction.....	1
The Three-Self Concept.....	2
The Wave from North America	6
The Dwindling Number of Career Missionaries in Haiti.....	7
The Harsh Post-Missionary Reality	9
Methodology	15
Summary of Chapter 1	16
2. THE BIBLICAL PROVISION FOR THRIVING MISSIONARY WORK THAT OUTLIVES	
MISSIONARIES.....	17
The Biblical Case for Missions.....	17
The Biblical Case for Self-Propagation	19
The Biblical Case for Self-Government	20
The Biblical Case for Self-Support and Interdependence.....	22
The Biblical Case for the Missionary Cycle	25
The Biblical Case for Strong Church Leaders	26
New Testament Guidelines for Pastoral Leaders.....	28
Scriptural guidelines for non-pastoral leaders	39
Chapter 2 Summary	41

3. THE CENTURIES-OLD CONVERSATION ABOUT THE SUSTAINABILITY OF	
MISSION WORK.....	43
Various Views on Self-Support and Interdependence	43
Various views on Self-Government and Paternalism	47
Various Views on Partnership	48
Various views on self-propagation	52
Various views on training nationals.....	54
Chapter 3 Summary and Conclusion	57
4. CASE STUDIES ON READINESS OF MISSIONARY-TO-NATIONAL LEADERSHIP	
TRANSITION.....	59
Case study on the Union of Evangelical Baptists of Haiti (UEBH)	59
Case study of the Worldwide Evangelical Mission	65
Case Study on the Association of Christian Churches International and Gospel Churches for Christ	72
Chapter 4 Summary	79
5. SUMMARY AND FINDINGS.....	80
Summary of Chapter One	80
Summary of Chapter Two.....	81
Summary of Chapter Three.....	82
Summary of Chapter Four	83
Findings.....	84
The difference between church planting and comprehensive missionary work	96
Conclusion	98

BIBLIOGRAPHY	100
VITA	104

ILLUSTRATIONS

Tables

1. Characteristics of pastoral leaders according to 1 Timothy 3 and Titus 129
2. Contrasts between Sponsorship and Partnership as reproduced from Brynjolfson52
3. Self-study for readiness of missionary-to-national leadership transition87

ABSTRACT

After western missionaries leave the field, their legacy tends to decay, especially in developing countries. Thus the gold standard for successful mission work – self-support, self-propagation, and self-government – is not attained. In order for this to happen, missionaries must develop pastoral and non-pastoral leaders who genuinely love God and receive adequate academic and practical training. Missionaries must also overcome paternalism.

Three case studies confirm that providing spiritual, intellectual and practical (both financial and managerial) readiness hold the best promise for missionaries to successfully entrust their work to developing world nationals. A self-study tool for readiness of missionary-to-national leadership transition is suggested.

CHAPTER ONE

THE THREE-SELF CONCEPT AS APPLIED TO DEVELOPING WORLD CHURCHES

Introduction

Few ventures have brought as much rightful pride to Christianity as missions. Behold the noble soldiers of the cross traverse the mighty oceans, leaving family and belongings in order to win souls for Jesus. They face anthropophagous tribes. They are sometimes caught between warring armies. Their children die from atrocious diseases that could be cured if they were within the reach of civilization. They pore over their manuscripts in order to make Scripture available in new languages. Under their watchful care churches are established, converts are nursed into the fundamentals of the faith.

Upon leaving the field, they well deserve these few lines from Patrick Gilmore's song composed in honor of the returning soldiers from the American Civil War:

When Johnny comes marching home again
Hurrah! Hurrah!
We'll give him a hearty welcome then
Hurrah! Hurrah!
The men will cheer and the boys will shout
The ladies they will all turn out
And we'll all feel gay
When Johnny comes marching home.

However, there is an unromantic side to missions, a tale that missionaries' countrymen by and large are not aware of. But those who are on the field endure it for years and decades on end. It is what happens after missionaries leave. Here is an all but too familiar picture: Mission compounds become a wasteland of dilapidated facilities. Inadequately funded programs slowly die out. Poorly prepared administrators waste what little moneys trickle in. "We wish the missionaries were still here," the nationals say as they powerlessly watch the missionary venture spiral down in an anticlimactic finale.

There seems to be a missing link that keeps the New Testament missionary cycle from being complete, some factor that hinders the mission field from becoming a mission force, a tone deafness that prevents national believers from hearing God's call to go into all the world, some blind spot that shuts their gaze on the promising mission fields that lie across the borders of their countries or across the oceans. Churches, even if they boom in size, seldom become like the ebullient Antiochian church of old whence Saul and Barnabas departed, having been set apart by the Holy Spirit to evangelize the Mediterranean Basin.

How then should western missionaries successfully entrust their work to developing world indigenous leaders so that the national church becomes self-governing, self-supporting, and self-propagating? This thesis-project intends to argue that the failure in national leadership after the missionaries leave is often due to a lack of planning that prepares the way for the growth of the work and the absence of a strategy to identify, recruit and prepare the right people to ensure progress and sustainability. In it we will also propose what we believe to be the solution to this problem.

The Three-Self Concept

Missionary statesmen Rufus Anderson (1796-1880) and Henry Venn (1796-1873) fathered almost simultaneously but separately the three-self formula of church growth or indigeneity – self-supporting, self-governing, self-propagating. Many theologians and missiologists concur on this concept as the gold standard for measuring mission success.

Robert Reese states,

The formula was the first projection toward a postcolonial mission method that respects local converts and cultures enough to assume that each locality can have active Christians who operate fully under the guidance and resources of the Holy Spirit to bring salvation in Christ to people in their context and beyond, for the glory of God. Many of its modern opponents seem to think local Christians in the developing world cannot carry out these

functions without help from foreigners. But why should anyone desire that bodies of believers in various parts of the world not become self-governing, self-propagating, and self-supporting, when this is exactly what it will take to complete the task of world evangelization? So the Three-Self Formula remains relevant because it takes Christians in the developing world more seriously than many other current popular mission methods that continue to create dependency.”¹

Self-propagation is defined as the possibility for the church to reproduce itself. The church or group of churches that is birthed through missionary labor needs to expand through the efforts of the nationals. The parent churches must become sufficiently mature and healthy to start church plants that are healthy and are implanted on a sound basis: adoration, edification, evangelization, compassion. One of the key indicators of success for self-propagation is a resolve from churches to fulfill Christ’s great commission, which is to “go... and teach all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost: Teaching them to observe all things whatsoever I have commanded you” (Matt 28.19-20a ESV) and to “be witnesses unto [Jesus]... unto the uttermost part of the earth” (Acts 1.8 ESV). They need to become part of the global missionary venture by sending missionaries and by supporting them.

Some missiologists have rightfully associated the concept of self-propagation to that of self-missionizing. In other words, those who reap the fruit of the Gospel must scatter its seed in new places beyond their cultural and geographical comfort zone. Indeed, Easter quotes, “[a] self-propagating national church effectively evangelizes on its own within the surrounding region and beyond. A self-propagating church should by nature be self-missionizing. There may be no greater indication of indigeneity than when a national church establishes a sending

1. Robert Reese, “The Surprising Relevance of the Three-Self Formula,” no. July-August, *Mission Frontiers* (2007): 25–27.

structure to mobilize workers to reach beyond its own people.’”²

Self-support refers to the ability of the indigenous church to support its workers and finance its plans with resources garnered from its constituency and not from outside sources. In its infancy the national church may be strongly supported by the contribution of the missionaries. It may lack the ability to pay workers or it may have a budget sufficient enough only for the basic needs of the ministry. But one mark of a healthy church is financial sufficiency, freedom from an unhealthy dependence on outside funds.

As for self-government, it implies that nationals lead the indigenous church without undue interference from outside sources, especially the missionaries. Ideally the national leadership should be trained, coached, duly empowered and released. The missionaries should become advisors and not deciders. Henry Venn wrote, “‘the euthanasia of a mission’ takes place when a missionary, surrounded by well-trained native congregations, under native pastors, is able to resign all pastoral work into their hands.’”³

However, these principles don’t always seem to be fully applied. For example, describing the status of missions in Zimbabwe up to the 1970s, Anne Elizabeth Dodge writes, “With their strategic network established the older NAPM [North American Protestant Missions] in this era generally focused their energies on the strengthening of the local church [...]. They were delinquent, however, in the practical application of Henry Venn’s proposal that the ‘aim of a mission is to call into existence self-governing, self-supporting, self-propagating churches.’ Fully

2. John L. Easter, “The Indigenous Church: Advancing Our Missions Strategy for the Next 100 Years,” *Enrichment Journal* (April 2014), accessed February 2, 2019, http://enrichmentjournal.ag.org/201404/201404_086_Indigenous_Church.cfm.

3. Shenk, Wilbert R., “The Contribution of Henry Venn to Mission Thought,” *Anvil* 2, no. 1 (1985): 25–42.

indigenous leadership of these churches was not realized until the 60s and 70s.”⁴

About self-support in Zimbabwean churches, Dodge writes, “A practical hindrance compounded by paternalism was the fact that very few mission churches, old or new, could be termed ‘self-supporting’. The traditional strategy was for NAPM to supply or subsidize pastoral salaries; the concept of ‘self-supporting’ churches was either not taught or, if it was, not modeled. When, in the 60s and 70s, missions realized their mistake the weaning process met with mixed results, mostly negative. There appeared to be no concept of a full-time Christian worker supported by the local people.”⁵

Paternalism is understood as the attitude and actions of missionaries acting as “fathers” in behalf of the indigenous “children” who, they deem, are not yet able to act as adults. According to Neumann, “an example of paternalism is a mission keeping control of a work because it feels that the locals are unqualified and would do themselves and the cause of Christ harm by taking leadership. Paternalistic attitudes assume superior knowledge, wisdom and skills. While well-intentioned in some cases, they fail to recognize the work of the Holy Spirit in young churches and their leaders.”⁶

Although paternalism must be properly identified and done away with, it is only fair to acknowledge that it is sometimes driven by shortsightedness. As Joseph Horevay rightly affirms about every Christian generation’s myopia regarding the purposes of God for missions, “The

4. Dodge, Anne Elizabeth, “A Historical and Analytical Overview of North American Protestant Missions in Zimbabwe: 1890-1987” (Yale Divinity School, Yale University, 1987), 87.

5. Dodge, 88–89.

6. Mikel Neumann, “Paternalism,” *Evangelical Dictionary of World Missions* (Baker Books, 2000), http://www.cycledoctoralfactec.com/uploads/7/9/0/7/7907144/evangelical_dictionary_of_world_mission.pdf.

problem of shortsightedness is anthropological, in that it is a side effect of our fallenness.”⁷

Sometimes ignorance is at the core of paternalism. Many people end up on the mission field without ever being schooled about missiological issues. They do what they think is best.

Anyway, whatever the cause may be, instead of succumbing to paternalism-induced missionary bashing, we must learn from missionaries’ strengths and avoid their mistakes.

Dodge also laments the lack of significant accomplishments in self-propagation: “The third ‘self’ of Venn’s proposal, that of self-propagation, was also generally a failure among NAPM in Zimbabwe. Mission strategy usually limited the definition of the word ‘missionary’ to European; nationals engaged in spreading the gospel were termed ‘evangelists’. Furthermore ‘the missionaries started Bible schools and theological seminaries to train leaders for the indigenous churches. They taught the usual run of subjects... everything but missions!’ It is not difficult to see why native churches remained complacent about the active ‘missionary’ task; for many their vision was no larger than sustaining their own existence.”⁸

Unfortunately Dodge’s observations about Zimbabwean have been standard fare on far too many mission fields. However, Melvin Hodges writes in his influential book, *The Indigenous Church*, “There is no place on earth where, if the gospel seed be properly planted, it will not produce an indigenous church. The Holy Spirit can work in one country as well as in another.”⁹

The Wave from North America

Protestants first set foot in Haiti in 1816. At the start they were mainly Methodists. The

7. Joseph Horevay, “Shortsightedness And The Purposes Of God | NEO House Church Network,” accessed April 6, 2020, <http://www.neohcn.org/resources/articles/shortsightedness-and-the-purposes-of-god>.

8 Dodge, 89.

9. Hodges, Melvin L., *The Indigenous Church* (Springfield (MO): Gospel Publishing House, 1976), 14.

Baptists came in 1823 and have steadily increased through most of the 20th century. According to Edner A. Jeanty, “It was during the 1915-1934 period, and especially during and after the Second World War (1939-1945) that evangelical missionaries began to enter Haiti at a steady pace until the country was inundated with missions of all kinds, registered at the Ministry of Foreign and Religious Affairs – almost 250 in 1995.”¹⁰

K.P. Yohannan writes, “In the 19th and 20th centuries there was a flood of missionaries to the colonies of the great European powers.”¹¹ This he calls the second wave, the first wave being the one that “broke over the New Testament world as the apostles obeyed the Great Commission.”¹²

The Dwindling Number of Career Missionaries in Haiti

However, the wave that flooded the shores of Hispaniola with Western Church envoys has gradually subsided into a trickle. Starting in the 1980’s, the influx of missionaries has steadily decreased. The tendency now is toward short-term missions. The missionary population has been shrinking. For example, Crossworld, a US-based mission agency, currently has 11 adult missionaries whereas in the 1980’s there were around 60. John Berger, vice-president for Global Operations and Strategy, explains this decrease as follows: “First, there was natural attrition due to departures of personnel for “life stage” reasons (retirement, health, career choices, etc.). Second, it seemed there was little needs-based urgency to replace those personnel because of the growing capacity of the Haitian church.”¹³

10. Edner A. Jeanty, *Le Christianisme en Haïti* (Bloomington, Indiana: AuthorHouse, 2011), 33.

11. Yohannan, K.P., *Revolution in World Missions* (Carrollton (TX): gfa books, 2003), 17.

12. Yohannan, K.P., *Revolution in World Missions*.

13. John E. Berger, “Information about Crossworld Missionaries in Haiti,” May 1, 2018.

Another agency, Baptist Mid-Missions, no longer has any foreign missionaries on the ground as of 2018. As missionaries are leaving reached countries¹⁴, nationals have to rise up to the challenge. But are they ready? Have missionaries and agencies adequately prepared for transition? Are they forced into an unprepared and unhealthy retreat mode or has the transition to national leadership been carefully thought out and planned? Is the national church ready for self-propagation, self-support and self-government?

Confirming this trend, Ronald Blue writes, “A number of well-established mission agencies are facing a crisis. More missionaries are retiring than are joining the mission. In other words, these missions are declining. There are fewer and fewer missionaries each year. Unless something changes, a death warrant looms over the agency.”¹⁵

Darrell L. Whiteman notes that “fewer and fewer missionaries are spending a lifetime among a people. The average length for a “career” missionary is now seven years.”¹⁶

Woodrow Kroll laments that “although the number of career missionaries, lifetime missionaries, the United States sends overseas continues to increase, the ratio of career missionaries to short termers continues to decline... You get the impression that we are headed for a short-term, part-time missionary force.”¹⁷

K.P. Yohannan believes that “the Western Church lost its grip on the challenge for world missions at the end of World War II. Ever since that time its moral mandate and vision for global

14. People groups are considered reached when there is a “Greater than 2% Evangelical Christian or majority Christian Population” [<http://www.thetravelingteam.org/stats/>, accessed on June 11, 2018].

15. Blue, Ronald, *Evangelism and Mission: Strategies for Outreach in the 21st Century* (Thomas Nelson, 2001).

16. Darrell L. Whiteman, “Anthropology and Mission: The Incarnational Connection,” in *Mission & Culture: The Louis J. Luzbetak Lectures*, The American Society of Missiology 48 (Maryknoll (NY): Orbis Books, 2012), 59–98.

17. Kroll, Woodrow, *The Vanishing Ministry in the 21st Century: Calling a New Generation to Lifetime Service* (Grand Rapids: Kregel, 2002), 42.

outreach has continued to fade.”¹⁸ That fewer career missionaries are coming is not troublesome in and of itself. But this means that nationals have to rise up to a challenge for which they may have not always been prepared.

One epoch-making event that probably caused the flow of missionaries going to developing world countries in the 1990’s to further recede is the fall of Communism. After the fall of the Berlin Wall in 1989 and the demise of Communism in Eastern Europe in the early 1990’s, a considerable percentage of the missionary force turned their focus to eastern European countries, further reducing the pool of missionaries going to “reached” mission fields. Communism, it is well known, is very repressive toward Christianity. After being entrenched in atheism for several decades, the former communist countries were opening up to the West and Christianity. The need for preaching the Gospel there seemed all the more urgent that nobody knew how long the opening in Eastern Europe would last. It is said that at the time “a massive ‘invasion’ of evangelical missionaries took place.”¹⁹

The Harsh Post-Missionary Reality

Whether a plan had been drawn or not, the national church was left to face the new, more often than not harsh, post-missionary reality. The national church in many a developing world country was suddenly coming of age and was on the verge of being called to become more a mission force than a mission field. Such churches face at least three challenges.

18. Yohannan, K.P., *Revolution in World Missions*, 75.

19. Anne-Marie Kool, “What Has Been Achieved in 25 Years of Eastern European Mission?” (presented at the Revolutions in European Mission, Bucharest, 2014), (accessed February 25, 2019), https://www.researchgate.net/publication/304213062_Revolutions_in_European_mission_What_has_been_achieved_in_25_years_of_Eastern_European_Mission.

The Leadership Lapse

According to Thomas Kopp, “While missionaries seem to have had the time to establish medical clinics and educational facilities, such as technical schools and high schools, they did not take the time for the necessary grounding of believers in the Word or to prepare them for leadership”²⁰ The leadership structure may be deficient, or worse, the national leaders may be right out poor leaders.

Failure in pastoral leadership

Many pastors have little formal training. They may be godly. But this is not enough to make the church self-propagating, self-supported and self-governed. Sometimes a structured leadership is inexistent among the nationals. There is in some cases no church association. And paternalism often stops the full emergence of national leaders.

Roland Allen describes the insidious outworking of paternalism on the mission field as follows: “A tradition very rapidly grows up that nothing can be done without the authority and guidance of the missionary, the people wait for him to move, and, the longer they do so, the more incapable they become of any independent action. Thus the leader is confirmed in the habit of gathering all authority into his own hands, and of despising the powers of his people, until he makes their inactivity an excuse to for denying their capacity.”²¹

What Pius Wakatama wrote over four decades ago about the developing world church leadership is unfortunately still true in many parts of the world: “To prepare the national church leader to run the empire the mission has placed on his shoulders, he usually has only three years

20. Kopp, Thomas J., “Church and Mission: Decolonizing the Mind,” *Evangelical Review of Theology* 28, no. 3 (July 2004): 265.

21. Allen, Roland, *Missionary Methods: St. Paul's or Ours* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1962), 81.

of Bible school training after his primary education. In rare cases he may have a B.A. from England or the United States. This does not help him much in his demanding task.”²²

He adds later,

Because of the lack of trained clergy, many of the young people pouring out of African high schools and universities look down upon the church. Our poorly trained pastors are finding it harder and harder to minister, especially in the urban centers. They are struggling to minister effectively to congregations with growing numbers of government officials, lawyers, doctors, nurses, policemen, clerks, teachers and professionals of all kinds with overseas training when they themselves have had little academic and theological education.²³

Writing about the need to select nationals for higher education, Wakatama shares some insight about missionary-national relationships that still holds true today and sheds some light on the poor leadership choices that missionaries sometimes make. He states,

From personal experience I have come to the conclusion that some missionaries are most happy with those nationals that tell them what they want to hear. They are more at home with the passive national who does not criticize anything but acquiesces in everything. Missionaries often regard such a national as ‘spiritual’ and are apt to bestow all kinds of favors on him, including overseas study.²⁴

Other favors might include spiritual oversight of a church, the position of chaplain or treasurer or teaching in a Bible school.

Failure in leadership succession

Missionaries don’t always help nationals become all out leaders. There are often some decisions that only the missionary can make. The revered icon appreciates the respect he receives from those he has seen grow in the faith. But when he leaves, nationals haven’t been taught a

22. Wakatama, Pius, *Independence for the Third World Church: An African’s Perspective on Missionary Work* (Downers Grove, Illinois: InterVarsity Press, 1976), 46.

23. Wakatama, 55.

24. Wakatama, 72–73.

decision-making process. They feel orphaned.

Wakatama relates an anecdote in which mission leaders flatly denied requests from African young people hoping to receive scholarships to study at Western universities. One of the arguments of the missionary leaders was that God uses people who are uneducated.²⁵ Granted most missionaries would not act similarly, yet for some their concept of leadership succession is a variation on the theme that when nationals lack education, it is a plus.

Failure in parachurch leadership

Parachurch ministries are a trademark of Christian missionary activity. When Christ's love is manifested, it leaves in its wake social works that are a natural outgrowth of evangelism. Day schools, hospitals, radio stations, Christian printing ministries, and Bible schools sprout where the gospel seed starts taking roots.

Then the day comes when nationals must take over those parachurch activities. Yet those on whose shoulders the proverbial mantle falls often do not have the necessary competencies to make them thrive. They usually come from the church or group of churches. They have little or no training on leadership. Their knowledge of administrative procedures is modest at best. They may be good teachers but not good school administrators. They lack experience. They haven't been exposed to the best practices in their fields. They are too short-sighted to become visionaries.

Financial Flop

There is no structure set up for fundraising and sustainability. When the funds dry up, the work withers and dies. The national church organization doesn't know what to do in order to

25. Wakatama, 78–79.

financially survive.

Missionaries are usually supported. This support is attributed to them for their salary, insurance, the ministries in which they are involved, and retirement among others. But when they leave the field, so do the funds. The nationals face the uphill challenge of raising funds to keep the ministries operating.

Besides, the indigenous workers who take over have to find other sources of income in order to do the same work and take care of their families. There is not much education concerning fundraising. Very little is done to teach savviness in business dealings. Added to all this, financial independence and sustainability is not taught from the start. Financial dependence often plagues mission fields after missionaries leave. Churches are seldom taught to prepare for the day when they will have to take care of their own pastors and workers. For instance, the Wycliffe Global Alliance, a network of organizations that work in the field of Bible translation, developed its Principles for Funding over an 18-month period after conducting a case study with its donors and affiliates. In a lengthy article recounting the whole process, the two authors report the following observations about the meeting with the African affiliates:

Those present were also asked what did not work well. Responses included: The church in Africa has not been educated to lead; Africa has been on the receiving end and this creates lethargy in and from the African church; [...] developing local capacity has been minimal; and major gulfs or separation are found between the funder/donor and recipients [...] Finally, the minimal focus on local capacity building was detrimental.²⁶

Granted that WGA's case study deals with Bible societies that are currently supported, one of the common weaknesses in the relations between the affluent West and the poor global South is still observable. Churches are seldom prepared to shoulder the financial responsibility that will be theirs when overseas funds are no longer available.

26. Kirk Franklin and Nelus Niemandt, "Funding God's Mission - Towards a Missiology of Generosity," *Missionalia: Southern African Journal of Mission* 43, no. 3 (2015): 399.

Technological Trouble

Technology is “the application of scientific knowledge to the practical aims of human life or, as it is sometimes phrased, to the change and manipulation of the human environment.”²⁷

Developing countries benefit from the contribution of Western missionaries in terms of technology. Printing machinery, radio equipment, generators, all-terrain vehicles, x-ray machines, computer equipment, lawn mowers, water pumps and a myriad of appliances make their way to the mission field and benefit thousands of people. After missionaries leave, however, machinery falls in disrepair and becomes unusable after a few months or years. Lack of financial resources is not the chief culprit in this case. In the experience of the thesis author, maintenance is not the forte of the nationals. Sheer negligence and the lack of technical know-how make up an explosive cocktail that reduces to mere carcasses valuable equipment that needs upkeep. The grass grows tall and unkempt where the lawn used to be tidy because lawn mowers are broken. Buildings fall into dereliction due to lack of maintenance. Printer fuses burn because too many sheets are printed in too rapid a succession. Meters are not checked. Maintenance becomes irregular. Where do you turn to when the machinery needs servicing? Few know how to order replacement parts. Due to the unreliability of the mailing system, receiving ordered parts is a headache anyway.

The nationals didn't invest any money to purchase the equipment. Those who handle it don't know how much it costs. The missionaries always fixed it when it broke down in the past. They didn't teach nationals how to use them and care for them. It is not ingrained in the nationals that this technology can keep benefiting them long after the missionaries are gone. The

27. The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica, “Technology,” *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, n.d., <https://www.britannica.com/technology/technology>.

unavailability of technology considerably hampers the progress of the Gospel.

Methodology

In order to find a solution to the problem that is exposed in this first chapter, the following methodology will be followed in this thesis-project. Chapter two is an analysis of the biblical and theological data that pertains to our topic. More specifically we will consider the biblical basis for missions, self-propagation, self-support and self-government for any mission work. Attention will be brought to the biblical evidence for missions to be carried out as a cycle that ends with the missionary going elsewhere to start over after letting the nationals take over. We will focus on the characteristics that the Bible gives about church leaders as well as non-pastoral leaders in three key areas: their character, their intellectual competence and their practical capacities. Chapter three will consist in a literature review. We will look at what others have said about concepts that are relevant to this research, such as self-government versus paternalism, dependency versus independence, the nature of partnership among Christian organizations, self-propagation, and leadership training. The fourth chapter will present case studies on three organizations that have reached different milestones in their transition to national leadership. One of them has gone through a successful transition. The second organization is far from turning over its ministries to nationals. The third group is currently going through this process and learning from it. In chapter five, we will summarize the preceding chapters, present the findings and end by submitting a self-study tool that allows to evaluate readiness for missionary-to-national transition.

Summary of Chapter 1

This thesis-project seeks to discover how western missionaries can entrust their work to Haitian nationals so that it becomes self-propagating, self-supporting and self-governing. This question is grounded on the observation that more often than not, after missionaries leave their field of service, their former ministries tend to disintegrate, as will be evidenced by at least one the case studies. The matter under consideration is of vital importance for Haiti because more and more career missionaries are leaving the field and a new trend in mission circles promotes short-term service ranging from a few days to several months and usually no more than a year. Shortly and inevitably, mostly nationals will be in the driver's seat of their mission organization, leading the destiny of the work they inherit as the western missionary force in that area depletes.

It has been established that the so-called "three-self concept" set forth by missions theoreticians Henry Venn and Rufus Anderson provides fair criteria for evaluating whether missionary labor has been truly successful in ensuring the transfer of the ministry to the nationals. First, efforts in self-propagation are often stifled by a lack of self-missionizing, that is evangelizing beyond the geographical confines of the indigenous group. Second, self-support is seldom attained because nationals are not purposefully and properly weaned from missionary support. Then, paternalism may hinder self-governance if not kept at bay. The situation after missionaries depart may be harsh to cope with for those staying on the field, because the nationals may not be prepared to step into the new responsibilities in church and parachurch leadership and because financial resources are not available.

CHAPTER TWO

THE BIBLICAL PROVISION FOR THRIVING MISSIONARY WORK THAT OUTLIVES MISSIONARIES

In this chapter we will consider the biblical and theological foundations for missions as well as the rationale for missionaries to raise and leave after they are gone a vibrant and growing work.

The Biblical Case for Missions

One of the questions that may be asked concerning western missionaries successfully entrusting the work to nationals is whether missions is a biblical concept in the first place. Does Scripture instruct Christians to be involved in missions? On what basis can Christians propose their faith to people groups who have adhered to other beliefs for generations? This is a very basic question. But the legitimacy of missions stands or falls with the answer to this question. It is assumed for the purposes of this thesis that missions is biblical.

The command of Christ calling on his disciples to take his word to the world appears in diverse phrasings at the end of all four Gospels and is restated in the book of Acts. According to Matthew, the Lord Jesus said to his disciples on a mountain in Galilee, “Go therefore and make disciples of all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit, teaching them to observe all that I have commanded you. And behold, I am with you always, to the end of the age” (28.19-20 ESV). In Mark, he appears to the eleven as they were eating and commanded them to “Go into all the world and proclaim the gospel to the whole creation” (16.15 ESV). According to the Gospel of Luke, Jesus appeared on the day of his resurrection to the eleven, to those who were with them and to two disciples who had met him earlier on their way to Emmaus. He told them that “repentance and forgiveness of sins should be

proclaimed in his name to all nations, beginning from Jerusalem” (24.47 ESV). Christopher Wright states, “Luke shows that the new centrifugal phenomenon of *mission to the nations*, to the ends of the earth, was not some unheard of innovation but simply (in the words of Jesus) ‘what is written’ (Luke 24:46-47) and (in the words of Paul) ‘nothing beyond what the prophets and Moses said would happen’ (Acts 26:22).”¹ And in John, Jesus appears to the disciples and tells them, “As the Father has sent me, even so I am sending you” (20.21 ESV). Before ascending to heaven, the Lord told his disciples, “And you will be my witnesses in Jerusalem and in all Judea and Samaria, and to the end of the earth” (Acts 1.8 ESV).

The book of Acts recounts how the Gospel moved from Jerusalem, to Judea to Samaria and to Rome, the capital of the ancient world. As truly as all roads led to Rome, so the roads from Rome led everywhere, all the way to the uttermost parts of the known world. The book of Acts speaks at length of the birth of the church, and the three-self formula reflects well what transpires from the storyline.

To summarize these passages, McLachlan states, “In Matthew 28:18-20 we are given the strategy of the ministry... In Mark 14:9 and 16:15 we are given the scope of the mission... In Luke 24:47 we are given the substance of the message... In John 20:21 we are given the source of the mandate... In Acts 1:8 we are given the sustenance of the messengers.”²

Now that it has been established that missions is biblical, what can be said about the tenets of self-propagation, self-support and self-government that several missiologists uphold as the gold standard by which to measure mission success? Are they rooted in Scripture or are they their own idea?

1. Wright, Christopher J. H., *The Mission of God: Unlocking the Bible’s Grand Narrative* (Downers Grove, Illinois: InterVarsity Press, 2006), 521.

2. McLachlan, Douglas R., *Thirsting for Authenticity: Calling the Church to Robust Christianity* (St. Michael, MN: Reference Point, 2017), 280–81.

The Biblical Case for Self-Propagation

Self-propagation is biblical. It means that the church must reproduce itself. The church or group of churches that is birthed through missionary labor needs to expand through the efforts of the nationals. Churches must become sufficiently mature and healthy to start church plants that are healthy in turn. One of the key indicators of success for self-propagation is a resolve from churches to fulfill Christ's great commission. They need to become part of the global missionary venture by sending missionaries and by supporting them. In order to describe this need, missiologists have coined the expression "self-missionizing"³, that is people who have trusted Christ through missionaries must become missionaries themselves.

The church of Jerusalem, albeit forced by persecution, undertook this self-missionizing activity. After Stephen died as a martyr, the harsh fire of persecution was ignited against the Christians who had no resort but to be flee throughout Judea and Samaria. And "those who were scattered went about preaching the word" (Acts 8:4 ESV). Later the text affirms that "those who were scattered because of the persecution that arose over Stephen traveled as far as Phoenicia and Cyprus and Antioch, speaking the word to no one except Jews. But there were some of them, men of Cyprus and Cyrene, who on coming to Antioch spoke to the Hellenists also, preaching the Lord Jesus" (Acts 11:19-20 ESV). So the Antiochian church came to existence thanks to the missionary activity of the believers who had been displaced from Jerusalem.

Antioch in turn became a hub of missionary activity. This church was "the cradle of

3. Easter, "The Indigenous Church: Advancing Our Missions Strategy for the Next 100 Years." *Enrichment Journal* (April 2014), accessed February 2, 2019, http://enrichmentjournal.ag.org/201404/201404_086_Indigenous_Church.cfm.

Gentile Christianity and of Christian missionary enterprise.”⁴ Antioch was located about 300 miles north of Jerusalem in Asia Minor, which is now part of modern Turkey. The church leaders did not wait for a signal from Jerusalem to send Barnabas and Saul out on a mission. They obeyed the injunction of the Holy Spirit to set these two men apart for the work to which he had called them. Antioch was the launching pad for Paul’s three missionary journeys (Acts 13.1, 15.36 and 18.23) and the landing spot for the first two (Acts 14.26 and 18.22 ESV). Under the leadership of the Spirit, Antioch became a self-propagating church.

The Biblical Case for Self-Government

Self-government is also biblical. New Testament churches were expected to reach self-governing capacity. The apostle Paul again sets the standard for this in his missionary journeys. He ordained leaders after establishing churches. Thus we read, “And when they had appointed elders for them in every church, with prayer and fasting they committed them to the Lord in whom they had believed” (Acts 14.23 ESV). The word used for “appointed” has the meaning of choosing by a “stretching of hand,” an ordaining by vote. William M. Ramsay writes, “It must, I think, be allowed that the votes and voice of each congregation were considered; and the term is obviously used in that way by Paul.”⁵ Apparently, the new believers were called upon to choose their own leaders or at least to have a say in their appointment by a show of hand. The apostle did not stay around to look over the new converts’ shoulders. Prayer and fasting preceded the commending of the chosen leaders to the Lord.

One of the most daring decisions that Paul and Barnabas made was to establish leaders to

4. Orr James, *The International Standard Bible Encyclopedia* (Delmarva Publications, Inc., 2018).

5. William M. Ramsay, *St. Paul: The Traveler and the Roman Citizen*, ed. Mark Wilson (Grand Rapids: Kregel, 2001), 108.

feed the flock of God after people were converted to the Lord. Their method consisted of three simple steps: pray, fast, and commend the new leaders to the Lord. That's exactly what the leaders of Antioch had done for them: "Then after fasting and praying they laid their hands on them and sent them off" (Acts 13.3 ESV). Acts 14.26 mentions that Paul and Barnabas "sailed to Antioch, where they had been commended to the grace of God for the work which they had fulfilled."

Paul said to the elders of Ephesus before he left them, "And now, brethren, I commend you to God, and to the word of his grace, which is able to build you up, and to give you an inheritance among all them which are sanctified" (Acts 20.32 ESV). Afterward he prayed with them. In 21st century terminology, he empowered and released the leaders. We need to trust God to do the same today. After carefully and prayerfully choosing the future leaders, missionaries must pray for them and commend them to the Lord.

Some instruction and training will certainly be necessary as is implied in Acts 14.21-22: "When they had preached the gospel to that city and had made many disciples, they returned to Lystra and to Iconium and to Antioch, strengthening the souls of the disciples, encouraging them to continue in the faith, and saying that through many tribulations we must enter the kingdom of God." They made disciples in Derbe and strengthened the souls of those in Lystra, Iconium and Antioch. Paul was committed to training workers for the ministry. His now famous word to Timothy is an evidence of that: "[A]nd what you have heard from me in the presence of many witnesses entrust to faithful men who will be able to teach others also" (2 Tim 2.2 ESV). The duration of training is not stated. However, it seems logical that the more complex the setting, the more extensive the training of indigenous workers should be.

Writing to Titus, the apostle reminds him that he left him on the island of Crete that he

might, among other things, “appoint elders in every town” (Titus 1.5 ESV). The point of analogy here is that missionaries should also endeavor to have churches pastored by national leaders. Self-government in the context of world missions means that the missionaries must relinquish control of the ministry to the nationals when the right moment comes and abstain from pulling strings, from making decisions while giving the nationals only token authority. Self-government implies that nationals lead the indigenous church without undue interference from outside sources, especially the missionaries. Ideally the national leadership should be trained, coached, duly empowered and released. The missionaries should become advisors and not deciders.

Behind the opportunity for self-governance lurks the danger of paternalism, the attitude and actions of missionaries acting as “fathers” in behalf of the indigenous “children” who, they deem, are not yet able to act as adults. This must give way to self-government, just as parents, though loving as they can be, let their children go establish their own home.

Self-government also implies that the national leaders are adequately prepared and have the qualifications outlined in Scripture in order to lead the work. More will be said about that later.

The Biblical Case for Self-Support and Interdependence

Self-support is a principle rooted in Scripture. In the primitive church, soon after Pentecost, the disciples “were selling their possessions and belongings and distributing the proceeds to all, as any had need” (Acts 2.45 ESV). This outpouring of generosity was such that “there was not a needy person among them, for as many as were owners of lands or houses sold them and brought the proceeds of what was sold and laid it at the apostles’ feet, and it was distributed to each as any had need” (Acts 4.34-35 ESV). Even the history of Israel seems to

condone the idea of self-support. The Old Testament recounts several such instances:

When it was time to establish organized worship in the wilderness God was pleased that His people gave themselves and their wealth for the construction of the Tabernacle (Exod 25:1–9; 35:4–29). Later, when the Temple replaced the Tabernacle, a rich member of the congregation (King Solomon) paid for it (2 Chron 2:1–18). But, the people of God later gave their own funds so that the Temple might be repaired (2 Chron 24:1–14). At that time they had no one like Solomon who could provide all the funds for the repairs by himself. God appointed the system of tithes and offerings in Old Testament Israel to provide support for the work of ministry as well as for the workers. This, too, was indigenous—no funds were raised from outside the congregation of Israel.⁶

Some argue that there must be interdependence rather than total dependence or self-support. The case for self-support and interdependence can be made from Paul’s fundraising efforts for the saints of Jerusalem. Non-Jewish churches took up a special offering for Christians in Jerusalem who were facing a famine.

The church of Jerusalem provided spiritual oversight at the inception of the church of Antioch. That’s why Barnabas was sent there according to Acts 11.22. Later on Antioch provided material help for the saints of Jerusalem. According to Acts 11, while a famine raged worldwide, the Christians of Antioch “determined, every one according to his ability, to send relief to the brothers living in Judea. And they did so, sending it to the elders by the hand of Barnabas and Saul” (vv. 29-30 ESV). This is a sublime instance of selflessness in that nothing indicates that the people of Antioch were not also affected by the famine since it was worldwide. Yet they chose to help their famished brothers and sisters in Judea.

In 2 Corinthians, still referring to the same offering, Paul promotes the idea of interdependence when he reminds the Corinthians that “your abundance at the present time should supply their need, so that their abundance may supply your need, that there may be

6. Bill Barrick, “How Can Mission Churches Be Self-Supporting? | The Master’s Academy International,” *The Master’s Academy International*, last modified December 22, 2017, accessed September 2, 2019, <https://www.tmai.org/how-can-mission-churches-be-self-supporting/>.

fairness” (8.14 ESV). The Christians of Achaia and Macedonia had enough material blessings to share with the Christians of Judea. At a later time, maybe the now impoverished Christians would have abundance and the now affluent believers would become needy. At this time the help would travel in the opposite direction.

Concerning the same offering, Paul puts a slightly different twist when he writes in Romans 15.27, “For they were pleased to do it, and indeed they owe it to them. For if the Gentiles have come to share in their spiritual blessings, they ought also to be of service to them in material blessings.” The idea is that the non-Jewish Christians owe, as it were, material things to their Jewish fellow believers because the Gentiles have been made rich spiritually thanks to the Jews. As the Lord Jesus said, “Salvation is of the Jews” (John 4.22 ESV). The modern-day situation is different, in that the parties are not necessarily Jews and non-Jews. Yet the application is the same: spiritual forebears are entitled to the material help of their children in Christ, because their offspring inherited spiritual blessings from them.

It may be argued that material help was necessary only in times of crisis but not on a regular basis. The church of Philippi is a case in point whose actions disprove this viewpoint. Paul reminded the Corinthians that “children are not obligated to save up for their parents, but parents for their children” (2 Cor 14.12 ESV). However, the Philippians provided several times for the needs of the great apostle. They became financial partners in furthering the Gospel with Paul. Twice when Paul was in Thessalonica and when he was later imprisoned in Rome, the Philippian saints supplied material and financial help. He fondly remembers their kindness and writes, “And you Philippians yourselves know that in the beginning of the gospel, when I left Macedonia, no church entered into partnership with me in giving and receiving, except you only. Even in Thessalonica you sent me help for my needs once and again” (Phil 4:15-16 ESV). This is

an admirable example of interdependence, of children saving up for their father in the faith.

The Biblical Case for the Missionary Cycle

Missionaries were never intended to stay forever on the mission field. The missionary movement out of Antioch serves again as a model of what may be called the mission cycle. First, the emissaries announced the gospel and made disciples (Acts 14.21). Second, Paul and Barnabas returned to the cities where they had made disciples “strengthening the souls of the disciples, encouraging them to continue in the faith” (Acts 14.22 ESV). They encouraged them to remain in the faith and warned them that they were going to endure affliction. Third, they “appointed elders for them in every church, with prayer and fasting” (14.23 ESV). This must be done prayerfully and with discernment. This is vital for the future success of the ministry. Although the epistles to Timothy and Titus were written later, choosing the leaders of the church was no guesswork. Fourth, “they committed them to the Lord in whom they had believed” (14.23 ESV) and left. Later, Paul does a follow up with those who had been saved. He wanted to make sure the brothers who had been converted under his ministry were doing well. He did the same for the Thessalonians. Since he couldn’t go, he “sent Timothy, our brother and God’s coworker in the gospel of Christ, to establish and exhort you in your faith” (1 Thess 3.2 ESV). Thus progress was verified, fellowship maintained and growth sustained (15.36).

Harold Fuller of Serving In Mission (formerly Sudan Interior Mission) was a witness of the transition between his mission organization and the Evangelical Church of West Africa in Nigeria in 1976. Sills explains Fuller’s approach as follows:

“When a missionary first arrives in an unreached, unevangelized area, his role is that of a pioneer... The pioneer missionary evangelizes and plants churches in the new area... The second role of missionary engagement is that of a parent or nurturer. Indeed, this is what many missionaries feel their call to be: discipling, training pastors, teaching pastors,

teaching training schools, and helping indigenous believers establish culturally appropriate forms of Christianity... The third missionary role is the partner missionary. This missionary works shoulder to shoulder with trained national evangelists, pastors, and professors. They share the work and the decisions, and they expand and develop the ministry in that context... The fourth role is participant... He will visit the old work from time to time and enjoy the preaching ministry of pastors who came to faith years ago under his own ministry. In areas where this role shifting does not occur, there is often dysfunction and tension.⁷

But as Ralph D. Winter rightly cautions, “Lucky is the missionary in whose own career this whole sequence of stages takes place. More likely the series represents the work in a specific field with a succession of missionaries.”⁸

So far this paper posits that missions is the plan of God for the church according to Scripture. Besides, it was demonstrated that the threefold objective of self-propagation, self-support and self-government is ingrained in the missionary practices of the apostles as revealed particularly in the book of Acts. Now what other scriptural principles should be considered in order for western missionaries to successfully entrust their work to third-world nationals?

The Biblical Case for Strong Church Leaders

Pius Wakatama writes,

From personal experience I have come to the conclusion that some missionaries are most happy with those nationals that tell them what they want to hear. They are more at home with the passive national who does not criticize anything but acquiesces in everything. Missionaries often regard such a national as “spiritual” and are apt to bestow all kinds of favors on him, including overseas study.⁹

7. Sills, M. David, *Hearts, Heads & Hands: A Manual for Teaching Others to Teach Others* (Nashville, TN: B&H Publishing Group, 2016), 43–44.

8. Ralph D. Winter, “Four Men, Three Eras, Two Transitions: Modern Missions,” in *Foundations of the World Christian Movement: A Larger Perspective*, ed. Ralph D. Winter (Pasadena (CA): Institute of International Studies, 2008), 286.

9. Wakatama, Pius, *Independence for the Third World Church: An African’s Perspective on Missionary Work* (Downers Grove, Illinois: InterVarsity Press, 1976), 72-73.

In order to avoid this mistake, it must be recognized that one of the main needs for the success and continuation of missions is the recruiting and training of strong national leaders. There is no way the national church will become self-propagating, self-supporting and self-governing if nationals are not prepared to take over. This paper contends that the most capable leaders must be found and the best training must be given them. This is key to the success of missions. An analogy may be drawn from the realm of academy. In institutions of higher learning, the bulk of teachers are at least one notch above the level where they teach. Hence master's level training, for example, is dispensed mostly or exclusively by teachers who hold doctoral degrees. Similarly, national leaders have to be one or several notches above the people they try to bring up to a higher plane. Why would we think that national leaders will by some sleight of hand do feats that they have no idea how to accomplish?

Missiologist David Sills has developed a pastoral training method based on decades of missionary service around the world. He suggests that "churches require godly, well-trained pastors and leaders with hearts for God, heads filled with truth, and hands that are skilled to minister. The way forward is training the whole man with the whole truth for the whole ministry."¹⁰ Sills is right.

When choosing indigenous pastoral leaders who will take over the work, missionaries must single out those people who have first of all saintly hearts, then Scripture-filled heads and finally, skilled hands (or at least those in whom those traits show some promise and can blossom). The concept of saintly hearts means that the person has a genuine fear and love of God. He must be an authentic Christian and not someone who is trying to please the mission to obtain favors. The notion of Scripture-filled heads refers mostly to traditional training in Bible and theology offered in the formal setting of Bible schools. Future leaders must know the Bible

10. Sills, 13.

well in order to teach its truths and not fall into heresies. As for the idea of skilled hands, it simply means that leaders must have proper knowledge of the how-tos of the ministry, like preaching, church administration, counseling, and community engagement.

A mix of the three is necessary in anyone who is worth an investment of time, money and energy for future leadership. Merely saintly hearts tend to be unable to perform practical tasks well. Some would joke that such people are so heavenly minded that they are no earthly good. Those who only have biblical and theological knowledge without saintly hearts are prone to think that they can outsmart God and others – “knowledge puffs up, but love builds up” (1 Cor 8.1 ESV). And left alone, skilled hands lose sight of the need for sound doctrine and righteous living as long as the practical side of the ministry keeps going.

New Testament Guidelines for Pastoral Leaders

On two different occasions Paul gives two of his collaborators, Timothy and Titus, two substantially similar lists in which he mentions the characteristics that church leaders should display in their lives. All the qualifications could be divided up along three main verbs: be, know, and do. The being aspect, or the heart, contains far more characteristics than the other two categories. This clue should certainly guide missionaries in the training of nationals. The knowing aspect or cognitive area has to do mostly with the ministry of the word. The doing aspect deals with practical requirements of the pastoral ministry.

The following table attempts to categorize the three aspects of being, knowing and doing as they appear in the two passages of 1 Timothy 3.1-7 and Titus 1.5-9.

Table 1. Characteristics of pastoral leaders according to 1 Timothy 3 and Titus 1

	1 Timothy 3	Titus 1
Qualifications related to BEING (SAINTLY HEARTS)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Above reproach (v. 2) → - The husband of one wife (v. 2) → - Sober-minded (v. 2) - Self-controlled (v. 2) → - Respectable (v. 2) → - Not a drunkard (v. 3) → - Not violent (v. 3) → - Gentle (v. 3) - Not quarrelsome (v. 3) → - Not a lover of money (v. 3) → - Not a recent convert (v. 6) - Well thought of by outsiders (v. 7) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Above reproach (vv. 6, 7) - The husband of one wife (v. 6) - Not arrogant (v. 7) - Not quick-tempered (v. 7) - Not a drunkard (v. 7) - Not violent (v. 7) - Not greedy for gain (v. 7) - Lover of good (v. 8) - Self-controlled (v. 8) - Upright (v. 8) - Holy (v. 8) - Disciplined (v. 8)
Qualifications related to KNOWING (SCRIPTURE-FILLED HEADS)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Able to teach (v. 2) → 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Hold firm to the trustworthy word (v. 9) - Able to give instruction (v. 9) - Able to rebuke those who contradictors (v. 9)
Qualifications related to DOING (SKILLED HANDS)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Hospitable (v. 2) → - Managing his own household well (v. 4) → - Keeping his children submissive (v. 4) → 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - His children are believers (v. 6) - They are not accused of debauchery (v. 6) - They are not insubordinate (v. 6) - God's steward (v. 7) - Hospitable (v. 8)

Being

Above reproach (1 Tim 3.2; Titus 1.6)

The two lists in 1 Timothy 3 and Titus 1 begin with the same qualification: above reproach. The two words translated by “above reproach” are different but synonymous in the original language. They mean “impregnable” and “not accused”. This certainly does not mean

that the leader is without sin. It will not be possible for anyone to achieve such a status before he is in the Lord's presence. According to 1 John 3.2, "what we will be has not yet appeared; but we know that when he appears we shall be like him, because we shall see him as he is." However, the pastor is someone against whom there exists no serious and founded accusation. Some commentators believe this qualification is a summary of all those that come after.

Husband of one wife (1 Tim 3.2; Titus 1.6)

Interestingly the requirement which is mentioned right after blameless is "the husband of one wife" in both passages. This is no accident. The inspired author wanted to emphasize an important aspect of the ministry: fidelity to one's spouse. This characteristic does not mean that the bishop or elder should be married. The apostle Paul himself was not married and recommends that same marital status to those who want to serve the Lord unhindered by family obligation: "But I say to the unmarried and to the widows: It is good for them if they remain even as I am [...] He who is unmarried cares for the things of the Lord – how he may please the Lord" (1 Cor 7.8, 32b ESV).

What is the meaning of the recommendation that the pastor be the husband of one wife? It is fidelity to his wife, the exclusive relationship existing between spouses, which nothing should compromise. This excludes those who are guilty of adultery. It is also a ban on polygamy. Some commentators argue that polygamy was not admitted in the Roman Empire and the apostle did not have polygamy in mind. However, this recommendation is no less a condemnation of polygamy. This qualification is essential. Its violation disqualifies *ipso facto* the person guilty of adultery from the ministry. How can a man guilty of infidelity to his wife ever preach on marital fidelity?

Sober-minded (1 Tim 3.2)

He is level-headed, calm, and full of moderation. For example, he doesn't rush to make important decisions. He habitually keeps from saying rash words for which he will have to apologize later. When given, his advice is well thought out.

Self-controlled (1 Tim 3.2)

This word has the idea of the bishop or pastor being circumspect. Circumspection literally means looking around. A fit image of vigilance and circumspection is a soldier who steps into enemy territory. He must look out for the enemy who may suddenly appear from anywhere, watch so he doesn't fall in a trap or step on a mine. The pastor after God's heart is always on his guard. He is careful about what he says and does. He knows that his testimony is constantly being watched and is careful not to compromise it. Some commentators prefer the translation temperate. As such, the leader is balanced and has self-control. He avoids emotional and doctrinal extremes. He is level-headed.

Respectable (1 Tim 3.2)

The word translated "of good behavior" is of the same family as the Greek word *kosmos*, which carries the idea of order. In other words, the spiritual leader must be orderly. This means, for example, that he dresses appropriately according to his own culture. His etiquette must be above reproach. His office should not be in total disarray. His house should not be decrepit by his neighborhood's standards. His appearance should inspire respect and reflect the orderliness of God, "For God is not *the author* of confusion but of peace" (1 Cor 14.33 ESV). The pastoral

ministry has an important social dimension. In fact, the pastor is the standard bearer of the church community. People inside and outside the church should not look down on him because he is negligent, dirty or unsociable. Instead, his dignified posture, coupled with Christian simplicity, should inspire respect.

Not a drunkard (1 Tim 3.3; Titus 1.7)

The phrase translated “not a drunkard” means that the leader should not be “next to wine.” Whether his position is tee totaling or moderate consumption, the pastor should never get drunk. Timothy understood the danger of falling into drunkenness and stayed clear from drinking wine. Paul warns Christians not to “do anything that causes your brother to stumble” (Rom 14.21 ESV).

Not violent, not quarrelsome, not quick-tempered (1 Tim 3.3, Titus 1.7)

These three characteristics go hand in hand and describe of how the man of God should not be in his relationships with others. He must not be violent, that is someone who is prone to hit others. Nor should he be quarrelsome or someone who gets into fights. He should not be quick-tempered, that is someone who loses his cool easily. The pastoral ministry, being first and foremost a life of service to people, provides abundant opportunities for poor human relationship skills to show up if they exist. Just as no one in his right mind builds his abode a stone’s throw from an active volcano, so parishioners will shun a pastor with an explosive character. The church must not be a powder keg but a haven of loving acceptance.

Gentle (1 Tim 3.3)

Rather than being violent, quarrelsome or quick-tempered, the overseer must be gentle. Gentleness, or patience as this competency is called in some translations, is a character trait that is akin to humility and kindness. A gentle person is approachable and respectful of others. He doesn't get easily irritated. He doesn't vociferously clamor for his rights. He is not rude to those who, say, interrupt him while he is doing something important. The elder, bishop or pastor is someone "who is not quick to jump into an argument or shouting match and who would never escalate it to violence to get his point across."¹¹ The adjective gentle "points to a considerateness and patient forbearance that would not tolerate violent methods. It recurs in Titus 3:2 in the Pastorals. It is enjoined in Philippians 4:5. The cognate noun is used in 2 Corinthians 10:1 of Christ, who provides *par excellence* as [sic] example of that quality."¹²

Not a lover of money/not greedy for gain (1 Tim 3.3, Titus 1.7)

The word translated "not covetous" in 1 Timothy 3.3 is the translation of a term meaning literally "who does not love money." Across the centuries, being in the ministry for the love of money has been a great temptation. Whoever considers the pastoral call must not engage in it for the sole purpose of satisfying his financial needs or ascending the social ladder. The pastor must remain alert against this trap. Thanks to his influence and the confidence he inspires by and large, the pastor can easily have access to the funds of the church or persuade parishioners to give him more besides his due salary. This is why the good will of the leader cannot be the sole

11. Sills, 126.

12. Donald Guthrie, *The Pastoral Epistles*, 2nd edition, Tyndale New Testament Commentaries (Leicester: Inter-Varsity Press, 1990), 93.

arbiter between his conscience and the possessions of the church. The spiritual leader should never be the only manager even if he has good intentions. This principle is inspired from the example of the apostle Paul himself. When an offering was taken up for the saints in Jerusalem, he sent Titus (2 Cor 8.6), who was accompanied by a brother “who is famous among all the churches for his preaching of the gospel” (8.18 ESV). He said he did so in order that “no one should blame us about this generous gift that is being administered by us, for we aim at what is honorable not only in the Lord's sight but also in the sight of man” (8.20-21 ESV). In addition, the apostle sent with the first two a third emissary who had been “often tested and found earnest in many matters” (2 Cor 8.22 ESV). Being accountable to other people reduces the temptation of financial gain and reassures observers.

The application of simple principles also protects the spiritual leader from the temptation to love Mammon more than God. Setting up an accounting system, issuing receipts, submitting periodic financial reports, managing funds with transparency will keep countless pastors and churches from getting embroiled in financial scandals. To avoid falling into the temptation of loving money, the pastor may be better off relinquishing altogether financial responsibilities to a group of competent and trusted individuals who will be held accountable.

Knowing

Holding firm to the trustworthy word as taught (Titus 1.9)

The subject matter that leaders must master is Scripture. In order to teach the word, they must know it well. Sills writes, “A call to the ministry is also a call to prepare. The ministry is no place for personal opinions that are not grounded in Scripture, nor is it a forum for entertaining;

it is for the ministry of the Word and prayer.”¹³ Pastoral leaders’ love, respect and faithfulness toward Scripture must be unwavering. They must not hold firm to human traditions or opinions but to the Word. Why? Because the Word is trustworthy and dependable.

This knowledge of and attachment to the Scripture is one of the focal points of the Pastoral Epistles. Paul writes the following commands to Timothy: “[A]nd what you have heard from me in the presence of many witnesses entrust to faithful men who will be able to teach others also... Do your best to present yourself to God as one approved, a worker who has no need to be ashamed, rightly handling the word of truth” (2 Tim 2.2, 15 ESV). The apostle encourages his younger friend and son in the faith to “continue in what you have learned and have firmly believed, knowing from whom you learned it and how from childhood you have been acquainted with the sacred writings, which are able to make you wise for salvation through faith in Christ Jesus” (2 Tim 3.14-15 ESV). Then he caps off his exhortation with this cardinal statement about the Word: “All Scripture is breathed out by God and profitable for teaching, for reproof, for correction, and for training in righteousness” (3.16 ESV). Then in a highly solemn plea given “in the presence of God and of Christ Jesus”, the soon-to-die apostle, as if drawing almost his last breath, enjoins Timothy to “preach the word” in a world where “people will not endure sound teaching, but having itching ears they will accumulate for themselves teachers to suit their own passions, and will turn away from listening to the truth and wander off into myths” (4.1-3 ESV).

This is where formal and informal training in Bible and theology is vital. Future leaders are best prepared in a setting where they can learn on a consistent basis to eat and digest the meat of the Word. Ideally they should assimilate the content of the Old and New Testament, master the historical-grammatical method of hermeneutics, be schooled in the doctrines of the faith,

13. Sills, 125.

come to grips with apparent discrepancies, and learn the nitty-gritty of biblical languages. They should be able to handle the Word with deftness.

Apt to teach/Able to give instruction in sound doctrine (1 Tim 3.2, Titus 1.9)

Second, overseers must be able to transmit what they know from the Word. The wide range of character qualities required of pastors should be found in any mature believer, except the “apt to teach” criterion, which is inherent to the pastor’s calling. If a man cannot teach, he should not be a pastor.

Able to rebuke those who contradict sound doctrine (Titus 1.9)

When trained national leaders know the Word of God, they can face those who contradict sound doctrine without losing ground to them. They will warn their flocks about false teaching and keep them from turning from the faith. They will even be able to convince opponents to accept biblical truth thanks to their skillful handling of the Word.

Doing

The doing category has a lot to do with family and home life as well as practical ministry qualifications.

Hospitable (1 Tim 3.2; Titus 1.8)

Hospitality appears under the “doing” category. Being hospitable is certainly an attitude to be had. But it can be exercised only in real-life situations. Etymologically in biblical Greek

hospitality means “love to strangers.”¹⁴ Hospitality consists in welcoming people into one’s home to temporarily feed or lodge them. Exercising this virtue was all the more necessary that inns were of ill repute and insalubrious in the days of the apostle. According to an article on the American Bible Society’s website, “[i]nns and innkeepers were not held in high esteem, at least by the rabbis formulating Mishnaic law. The Mishnah places innkeepers on the lowest scale of degradation.”¹⁵ People in the ministry or looking to enter the ministry must show hospitality, which is oftentimes recommended in Scripture as a virtue that all Christians should practice (Rom 12.13; Titus 1.8; Heb 13.2; 1 P 4.9). Pastors are to welcome itinerant preachers in particular (3 John 8).

Manages his own household well

The first observation that draws the attention of the careful reader in 1 Timothy 3 and Titus 1, is the prominent place given to the family of the leader. In fact the first responsibility of the leader is to properly lead his family. His priority, besides his personal relationship with God is a proper relationship with his wife and children. If he fails in the leadership of his family, he cannot lead the church. Many make the mistake of placing ministerial duties above family responsibilities: “I’ll look after the affairs of God; God will look after my family,” we sometimes hear. This is a serious error, as evidenced by various references to the family in these passages. It is ludicrous for a negligent husband and father to ask God to “manage” his household for him whereas God has already asked him to do just that.

14. Joseph Henry Thayer, *The New Thayer’s Greek-English Lexicon of the New Testament* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1981), 654.

15. “Inns and Innkeeping | Resources | American Bible Society,” *American Bible Society Resources* (accessed May 31, 2019), <http://bibleresources.americanbible.org/resource/inns-and-innkeeping>.

He keeps his children submissive (1 Tim 3.4) / They are not insubordinate (Titus 1.6)

The pastoral leader or candidate must show his leadership abilities over his children first. Not securing one's children's submission shows a fundamental lack of wisdom from the man called to the ministry or even a character flaw. How can he earn the respect and submission of the flock if he can't get it from his own children?

As Homer Kent states, "when children are in the home, they must be kept in submission with all reverence. (It is the father who must show reverence.) The father who spends his time slapping his children will usually treat the members of his church just as harshly. Even within intimate relationships among the members of a family, a dignified and respectful relationship should be maintained."¹⁶

His children are believers (Titus 1.6)

The children of leaders must adhere to the faith of their father. What if children are not faithful despite the good example and instruction of their parents? Admittedly God-fearing men like Hezekiah may father such impious sons as Manasseh. But it must also be acknowledged that often the ungodliness of children is directly attributable to the poor judgment of parents or their failure in some area of the spiritual training of their children. God said about Abraham, "For I have chosen him, that he may command his children and his household after him to keep the way of the LORD by doing righteousness and justice, so that the LORD may bring to Abraham what he has promised him" (Genesis 18:19 ESV). Joshua said in his farewell speech to Israel, "But as for me and my house, we will serve the Lord" (Joshua 24.15 ESV). These two men took it upon themselves to lead their families and children in the way of godliness.

16. Homer Kent, *Les Épîtres pastorales: Étude des première et deuxième épîtres à Timothée, et de l'épître à Tite* (Trois-Rivières (Canada): Impact, 1981), 116. (This writer's translation from French).

His children are not accused of debauchery (Titus 1.6)

If children persist in quiet unbelief, they should at least refrain from openly rebelling against the authority of their parents as long as they live under their roof, because they must not be “open to the charge of debauchery” (Titus 1.6 ESV). Cases of open rebellion against the parents’ authority are likely to result in the disqualification of the father.

Above reproach as God’s steward (Titus 1.7)

The pastor is God’s steward. He manages the church in God’s behalf. He must do it with dexterity. This qualification opens a window on all the practical aspects of the ministry that depend on the pastor for the church to operate well. Anderson states, “The starry-eyed young pastor who reports to his first church expecting to do little else than study and preach the Word is in for a rude surprise when he finds out how many administrative duties confront him”¹⁷ He is in charge of the organization of the church. There is no set curriculum to learn to care for these tasks, but the man of God needs skilled hands to fulfill them. The pastor must administrate, plan, distribute tasks, make sure that widows are cared for, perform baptisms, weddings and funerals, set goals for the church, lead in managing church finances, apply church discipline, eventually lead a construction program to name just a few of his responsibilities as a steward.

Scriptural guidelines for non-pastoral leaders

Other leaders who are not involved in pastoral ministry will also need to be raised if the work is to flourish and not flounder after missionaries leave. Parachurch organizations spring up

17. Robert C. Anderson, *The Effective Pastor: A Practical Guide to the Ministry* (Chicago: Moody, 1985), 277.

alongside churches as needs arise: printing ministries, hospitals, schools, bookstores, and radio stations, for instance. The same triad of being, knowing and doing applies to those who must be groomed to take over the parachurch organizations or mercy ministries as they are sometimes called. Just like pastors, they need to have saintly hearts. The difference is that their head knowledge and practical skills have to be in the field in which they are called to work instead of Bible and theology or pastoral ministry skills. When God asked Moses to build the tabernacle in the desert, the Lord pointed to him two workmen that he wanted to do the job. Their names were Bezaleel and Oholiab. According to Exodus 31.1-5, “The LORD said to Moses, ‘See, I have called by name Bezalel the son of Uri, son of Hur, of the tribe of Judah, and I have filled him with the Spirit of God, with ability and intelligence, with knowledge and all craftsmanship, to devise artistic designs, to work in gold, silver, and bronze, in cutting stones for setting, and in carving wood, to work in every craft.’” Bezaleel, Oholiab and many other skilled people were filled with the Spirit of God. Of course this was a supernatural filling with a view to building the tabernacle, fabricating sacred furniture, making holy garments and preparing anointing oil and incense. Yet this filling also reflects the relationship that existed between the Spirit-enabled workman and his Spirit-filling God. In the New Testament believers are commanded to be filled with the Spirit (Eph 5.18). The filling of the Spirit is the *summum bonum* for the Christian on earth. This filling brings at once: “love, joy, peace, patience, kindness, goodness, faithfulness, gentleness, self-control” (Gal 5.22-23 ESV). Someone who is filled with the Spirit of God is rightly related to God.

Besides, Bezaleel was filled “with ability and intelligence, with knowledge and all craftsmanship” (Exod 31.3 ESV). Clearly, he knew inside out all the necessary notions he needed to accomplish the work. He was exceptionally skilled in jewelry, sculpture, design,

metallurgy, and perfumery. Thirdly, he was able to “devise artistic designs, to work in gold, silver, and bronze, in cutting stones for setting, and in carving wood, to work in every craft” (Exod 31.4-5 ESV). Bezaleel had not only the head knowledge but also the skillful hands to give a faithful rendition of the intricate project that the Lord had conceived and shown to Moses on Mount Sinai.

God-fearing leaders must receive the highest possible training in their specific fields of specialization if any mercy ministry is to outlive the departure of expatriates and outshine its performance under missionary leadership. National workers must be trained in the best schools at home or abroad, placed in the best possible hands-on internships, mentored by the best possible experts. Thus equipped, they will take the ministry to the next level. Spontaneous generation doesn’t happen in leadership any more than it happens in biology.

If careful leadership succession with a focus on educating the nationals is not planned, more often than not the work will go awry and the years-long construction process may come to a crashing halt. That is the kind of chronicle of disasters foretold that the missionary venture may unfortunately spawn but can thankfully prevent.

On a different note, Asaph basks, when he concludes his monumental 78th psalm, in the fact that “[w]ith upright heart [David] shepherded [Israel] and guided them with his skillful hand” (v. 72 ESV). No matter the time, the place or the position, God’s minimal standards for leaders who serve him will always include an upright heart and skillful hands.

Chapter 2 Summary

Chapter 2 lays the biblical and theological foundation that undergirds the current thesis, which explores how western missionaries can successfully entrust their work to developing

world indigenous leaders. Such success will materialize as the church becomes self-supporting, self-propagating and self-governing. First, for the purposes of the thesis, it is assumed that missions is biblical. The four Gospels and Acts record Christ's unequivocal command to his disciples to take the Good News to the whole world. Second, the first two most influential churches of Christendom, in Jerusalem and Antioch, are observed to model self-propagation. They reproduced themselves whether forced by persecution or sent by divine vocation. Thirdly, the case for self-government is made by the example of the apostle Paul himself who appointed leaders over local bodies of believers after commending them to the Lord. Fourthly, self-support and interdependence, it was shown, also bear God's stamp of approval for a church that is healthy. As a proof of self-support, primitive church Christians happily deprived themselves of their possessions to help their needy brothers and sisters. And the material-for-spiritual help that Antioch exchanged with Jerusalem exemplifies a type of interdependence that is worthy of emulation. Fifthly, this chapter establishes from Scripture the existence of what can be called a missionary cycle, which is beautifully summarized in Harold Fuller's alliteration according to which the missionary starts as a pioneer then becomes a parent, a partner and finally a participant. The sixth part of the chapter considers in detail the New Testament guidelines for pastoral leaders as found in 1 Timothy 3 and Titus 1, distributed under three headings: being, knowing and doing. Under the eighth heading, the matter of scriptural guidelines for non-pastoral leaders are considered. Through the example of Bezaleel and Oholiab in the Old Testament, the same triad of being, knowing and doing was highlighted as a scriptural obligation for those who will invest themselves in parachurch ministries.

CHAPTER THREE

THE CENTURIES-OLD CONVERSATION ABOUT THE SUSTAINABILITY OF MISSION WORK

Much thought has already gone on about the topic that is of interest in this paper. The conclusions that various writers and thinkers have reached will be considered in order to enrich our own understanding on the topic of how Western missionaries successfully entrust their work to developing world nationals.

Various Views on Self-Support and Interdependence

In an article titled, *The Indigenous Principle Revisited: Towards a Coactive Model of Missionary Ministry*, John F. Carter proposes an innovative approach to cooperation between indigenous leaders and missionaries. While the traditional model calls for indigenous churches to become self-supporting, self-governing and self-propagating, Carter proposes a model that is based on interdependence rather than independence. This model “recognizes that perpetuating the results of missionary ministries requires that they be based on the cooperation and joint commitment of the missionary and national church bodies in recognition of the individual contributions that each can best make.”¹ An overemphasis on independence, Carter writes, “leads to a premature disengagement of the missionary body from responsibilities for the ministries they have initiated and provides a justification for “dumping” ministries on the national church when they may be ill-prepared to receive them. The missionary leaves feeling gratified in having

1. John F. Carter, “The Indigenous Principle Revisited: Towards a Coactive Model of Missionary Ministry,” January 1998 (accessed May 31, 2019).

"indigenized" his ministry when, in fact, he has consigned it to probable extinction."²

Glenn Schwartz is a leading proponent of freedom from dependency, which can be defined as an almost total reliance on foreign contribution for the advancement of the national ministry. Schwartz has a totally different outlook on the matter. In an article titled *Is There a Cure for Dependency among Mission-Established Churches?* Schwartz describes the whole gamut of possible reactions to the issue of indigenous churches' dependency on foreign funds by mentioning seven categories of Christians in relationship with nationals. He lists those who are embarrassed by the situation, those who think nothing can change the reality of dependency, those who plant new churches that are independent and do not rely on outside help, those who have given up on the ideal of a self-supporting indigenous church, those whose salary is paid by outside donors and have come to the conclusion that their people's poverty is too steep to keep the work going, the leaders of newly established works who are actively seeking foreign help, and finally those who have moved from dependence on foreign funds to reliance on local resources to finance their ministry. According to Schwartz, dependency affects the meaning of the gospel and makes people think that they come to the faith in order to obtain some material benefit, much like a group of Tanzanians who scorned missionaries whom they had met for the first time, because the expatriates did not have any shipping containers.

As a solution to this problem, Schwartz makes several suggestions. He advocates the teaching of tithing in the church, giving as an example a very poor congregation in South Africa that became rich over the course of thirty years. He suggests that national leaders may have to come to the point where they say no to the foreign help on which they have depended heretofore. Schwartz also argues that funds coming from westerners should be used to evangelize those who have not yet heard the good news instead of supporting those who have known the gospel for

2. Carter, 1998.

decades.³

Some of Schwartz's ideas, like encouraging people to take full personal ownership for their churches and learning to say no to foreign supporters, make sense. However, westerners should not expect nationals in developing countries to just know that they need to be self-supported. Missionaries and donors should teach churches and leaders self-help and skills that will bring self-reliance. There are a few success stories like the ones Schwartz mentions.

However, Thomas Hale voices a wise caution to this approach when he affirms,

It seems hard to be "wise" in this matter of helping national churches financially. There is no question they need and deserve our help, just as the Jerusalem needed and deserved the help of the Greek churches in Paul's day – though there the money flowed from new churches to old. [...] But experiences differ widely. Some Christian groups have reduced or withdrawn support and seen revival break out in the national church. Was it the result of less outside money? These groups believe so. But on the other side, people like McGavran speak of numerous people movements that have been nipped in the bud for lack of financial support. Missionaries involved have withheld money, and the movement has fizzled. [...] How do we choose between these two extremes? [...] Don't set fixed policies. But if we could offer one guideline it would be this: Err on the side of not giving when ongoing expenses are involved; and err on the side of giving when unusual need or opportunity is involved.⁴

In the world of missions where a battle rages on between supporters and opponents of granting financial support to indigenous churches, one viewpoint argues that we live in an increasingly interconnected world. Therefore if money from the USA can support a ministry in another developed country like Canada, why can't it be used to support a ministry in Kenya or Jamaica? That's what Daniel Rickett calls eliminating double standards. He exposes the ambivalence of Schwartz's argument and others similar to it as follows, "It is right for North Americans to spend money on displaced families in Sudan, but it is wrong for Sudanese to spend

3. Glenn J. Schwartz, "Is There a Cure for Dependency among Mission-Established Churches," World Mission Associates (July 2000), <https://www.gcde.org/article-is-there-a-cure-for-dependency.html> (accessed May 31, 2019).

4. Thomas Hale, *On Being a Missionary* (William Carey Library, 1995), 260.

American money to aid displaced families in Sudan. It is acceptable for North Americans to financially support a North American missionary, for instance, in Timbuktu, but it is unacceptable to support a Malian missionary in Timbuktu.”⁵

John Rowell’s perspective is also at odds with Schwartz’s. He writes,

If westerners sit at the end of the Father's table that is well-provided with food and all the bowls at the other end of the table are empty or nearly so, it is not degrading or dehumanizing or wrong for one brother to ask another to pass the bread from the abundantly supplied part of the feast set before us. Refusing to share the Father's bounty, on the other hand, is an action that is rooted in selfishness, and letting our siblings go hungry while we are well-fed is wrong.⁶

Rowell’s viewpoint seems rather harsh. Some people may rather not give because of ignorance or by choice without being necessarily selfish.

Bob Finley believes that an acute difference resides between supporting churches and supporting para-church ministries. He states, “Most local churches in America are self-supporting, as they should be in other countries. But there is no such thing as a self-supporting mission board, or Bible institute, or Scripture translation ministry or home for destitute children. All such para-church ministries are dependent on the gifts of God’s people for the continuation of their work”⁷ In an article, Finley also states that “providing financial support to indigenous ministries is effective *if* a clear distinction is made between directly supporting individual workers [...] and [...] supporting such workers indirectly through indigenous missions boards

5. Daniel Rickett, “Walk with Me (Part 2): The Path to Interdependency” (n.d.): 1, http://www.danielrickett.com/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/Walk-with-Me-Part-2_-The-Path-to-Interdependency.pdf (accessed May 31, 2019).

6. Rowell, John, *To Give or Not to Give?: Rethinking Dependency, Restoring Generosity, and Redefining Sustainability* (Tyrone (GA): Authentic Publishing, 2006), 18–19.

7. Bob Finley, *Reformation in Foreign Missions* (Xulon Press, 2005).

that give oversight to the handling of funds”⁸ Finley’s viewpoint is enlightening. It is helpful to financially support institutions instead of individuals since institutions usually live longer than people. Therefore, funds would be available regardless of the people in function. Such a strategy helps circumvent the dying out of funds that usually accompanies missionaries’ departure.

Various views on Self-Government and Paternalism

According to Fred Downs, self-government means “full responsibility for the power structure within which final decisions concerning policy and program are made for the whole of the church. This means turning over to the indigenous body not only the authority and functions of the board’s field organization but also the powers and responsibilities that the home board itself has exercised in relation to the work of that field.”⁹

In the 19th century Henry Venn insisted on the need for the gradual disappearance of the Mission so that well-trained national leadership could emerge. He writes,

Regarding the ultimate object of a Mission, viewed under its ecclesiastical result, to be the settlement of a Native Church under Native Pastors upon a self-supporting system, it should be borne in mind that the progress of a Mission mainly depends upon the training up and the location of Native Pastors; and that, as it has been happily expressed, the “euthanasia of a Mission” takes place when a missionary, surrounded by well-trained Native congregations under Native Pastors, is able to resign all pastoral work into their hands, and gradually relax his superintendence over the pastors themselves, ’til it insensibly ceases; and so the Mission passes into a settled Christian community. Then the missionary and all missionary agencies should be transferred to the “regions beyond.”¹⁰

Roland Allen states, “It is the training of the first converts which sets the type for the future. If the first converts are taught to depend on the missionary, if all work, evangelistic,

8. Bob Finley, “Send Dollars and Sense: Why Giving Is Often Better than Going,” *Christianity Today*, no. October 4 (1999): 74.

9. Fred S Downs, “Mission Boards and Indigenous Churches,” *Occasional Bulletin from the Missionary research Library* XIX, no. 3 (March 1968): 9.

10. Henry Venn, quoted in Wilbert R. Shenk, *Henry Venn--Missionary Statesman: Missionary Statesman* (Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2006), 120.

educational, social is concentrated in his hands, the infant community learns to rest passively upon the man from whom they receive their first insight into the Gospel.”¹¹

Backed by anthropological research in religious change, Alan Tippett presents three possible outcomes for second generation mission fields with regards to paternalism. According to him, either a “local congregation remains subordinate to the paternalistic mission” or it “emerges from paternalism as the Church in the local situation, [...] making its own decisions, looking into its own financial responsibilities” or again “[f]requently a local group, [...] unable to break free from mission paternalism or control, reinforces its selfhood with neo-pagan dimensions and becomes a Christopagan breakaway movement” which “represents a serious loss to missionary effort and devotion.” Unfortunately the author does not mention any specific instance of the worst-case scenario. Obviously, from Tippett’s analysis, it is desirable that the local church emerge from paternalism. Thus he concludes, “The church of Jesus Christ can only really grow properly in the second or dynamic situation.”¹²

Various Views on Partnership

To what extent should a mission organization maintain ties with the indigenous leaders? What does partnership between a mission and the national church look like? According to Daniel Rickett, a partnership is “a complementary relationship driven by a common purpose and sustained by a willingness to learn and grow together in obedience to God.” He argues that in order for a partnership to be successful, three requirements are in order:

One, partnering organizations must be independent of one another... Independence is a prerequisite for interdependence... Two, there must be compatibility in doctrinal beliefs and ministry values... if, for example, one partner emphasizes holistic ministry, that

11. Roland Allen, Roland, *Missionary Methods*.

12. Alan Richard Tippett, *Introduction to Missiology* (Pasadena (CA): William Carey Library, 1987), 374.

should be more than passing interest to the other partner... Three, each partner must know and be willing to exchange complementary strengths and resources. Unless each partner has something the other needs, there is nothing to be exchanged.¹³

Writing for the benefit of the financial contributors in joint ventures in missions, Andy Johnson suggests six characteristics of successful partnerships between a local church and foreign nationals, individual missionaries or parachurch organizations. First of all, partnerships must be servant-minded. He writes, “Being willing to do *whatever* the field workers or missions leaders deem helpful is the right place to begin. It means saying, ‘What can we do to serve and partner with you? Nothing is too big and nothing is too small.’” He insists, as does Rickett, on the necessity for partners to be compatible:

When making partnerships (especially those focused on church planting), you should not assume theological agreement but honestly discuss issues like evangelism, ecclesiology, soteriology, and more—*before* entering into a partnership. The fact that both partners call themselves ‘evangelical’ or belong to the same denomination may not be enough.”¹⁴

Second, church pastors must take the leadership in the partnership. This happens when the pastor has a passion for missions, preaches on missions from various texts throughout scripture, prays “regularly from the pulpit for the work of the gospel overseas” and travels to the field “to support the work of missions.” Thirdly, partnerships should be based on relationships. The congregation should know the people with whom they are partnering. Johnson goes as far as to suggest that workers who are not from the church “could spend extended time living among your members.” He argues, “Inviting workers to spend their entire stateside assignment with your congregation and providing them free housing is a great way to do this.” Fourth, partnerships should be commitment-centered. This means “working with a long attention span,

13. Rickett, Daniel, *Building Strategic Relationships: A Practical Guide to Partnering with Non-Western Missions*, 3rd ed. (Orlando (FL): Stem Press, 2008), 16.

14. Andy Johnson, *Missions: How the Local Church Goes Global* (Crossway Books, 2017), 73, accessed November 12, 2018, <https://www.scribd.com/book/356264802/Missions-How-the-Local-Church-Goes-Global>.

for the long haul. In good years and bad. When your partnership is encouraging or just plain hard.” Fifthly, partnerships should be congregation-wide. All members of the church need to understand that “missions is a core part of the ministry of the church, not one among many optional ministries on the periphery, for certain people who are ‘interested in that sort of thing.’” Lastly, according to Johnson, partnerships should be long-term focused. Two routes may lead to cooperation aiming for the long run. On the one hand, “your church should work to cultivate long-term overseas workers from your own congregation. At the outset of a partnership, why not articulate the explicit goal that some of your own members will uproot their lives and plant them long-term in another culture for the sake of the gospel? On the other hand, this may be fleshed out as “doing short-term trips with the long-term mind-set. Rather than just providing ‘missions experiences,’ consider trips that support the work of existing long-term teams to whom you are committed.”¹⁵

Although Johnson writes from the vantage point of a local church leader as opposed to a missions organization leader, the thoughtfulness of his approach can serve as a starting point for any mission organization that is willing to create a mutually beneficial partnership with nationals who are called to inherit the work that missionaries started.

Thomas Kopp contrasts two possible approaches in partnership – the business model and the family model, which he favors:

Both the Mission and the Church (but particularly the Mission) will need to bear in mind the two most common models used in approaching partnership, consciously moving from the ‘business’ model to the ‘family’ model. [...] The business model views people as stockholders, while the family model sees them as members. Control in the business model is maintained with money, but in the family it is relationships that keep control. In the business model the emphasis is on activities, while the family model values fellowship.¹⁶

15. Andy Johnson, *Missions: How the Local Church Goes Global*, 73–80.

Kopp also suggests practical ways in which foreign missions and national churches can engage in fruitful partnerships in the African context. This can be true for any developing world setting:

Missions and Churches could sponsor pastors' conferences to which they could invite a Bible teacher, an experienced churchman... not only to study the Word together, but to tackle the kind of issues being faced in their areas... There are both expatriates and African church leaders who would like to pursue advanced degrees and doctoral level research in church- and/or theologically-related matters. Both the Mission and the Church can encourage such potentially enhanced leadership skills by arranging bursaries for candidates to study at both the master's and doctoral degree levels; this would pay rich dividends for both. Such bursaries could be granted on a 'contract' basis, which require all bursary funds received by the student to be paid back should the degree program not be completed. Also, the contracts could stipulate that the recipient be required to give a certain number of years to the Mission or Church following the completion of the degree before becoming available for other ministry opportunities.¹⁷

These are good ideas. And others could be added. An indigenous church may decide to give financially through or to the parent organization for a one-time need or an ongoing ministry, for example. There can be student and professor exchanges. The parent organization may temporarily hire competent nationals or bring in interns from the country where the church is located in order to groom them for future leadership.

Rob Brynjolfson differentiates sponsorship from partnership. Either of these two opposite approaches may characterize the relationships between a missionary organization and national leaders. He summarizes the contrasts in a table that is reproduced below.¹⁸ He favors by far the partnership model.

16. Kopp, Thomas J., "Church and Mission: Decolonizing the Mind," 256.

17. Kopp, Thomas J., "Church and Mission: Decolonizing the Mind," 268–69.

18. Brynjolfson, "From Synthesis to Synergy: The Iguassu Think Tanks", in *Global Missiology for the 21st Century: The Iguassu Dialogue*, ed. William D. Taylor (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2000), 477-88.

Table 2. Contrasts between Sponsorship and Partnership as reproduced from Brynjolfson

SPONSORSHIP	PARTNERSHIP
Money	Gifts
Control	Communion
Donation	Participation
Hierarchy	Equality
Imposed vision	Shared vision
Short term	Enduring
One-sided	Mutual
I – You	We
Domination	Cooperation
Dependence	Interdependence
Parent – Child	Peers
Suspicion	Trust
Unhappiness	Joy

Various views on self-propagation

Whereas several authors insist on the role of leaders to establish the church throughout the world, in his book on cross-cultural church planting, David Hesselgrave points to the importance of laypeople in the propagation of the church. “Without question,” he writes, “the fact that New Testament churches were established and grew as rapidly as they did was due in significant measure to the contribution of dedicated laypersons.”¹⁹ He proves his point by alluding to a remarkable movement from the pages of church and mission history:

History reveals that one of the most successful movements of the modern era was that of the Moravians. Within twenty years (1732-52) they started more missions than did all Protestants put together in the two preceding centuries. Why? Because the Moravians saw evangelization as essential and made it a common concern for their community. How? By sending small groups of ordinary believers to establish themselves in new areas and testify for Christ... they sent nuclei of believers to even the remote areas of the

19. Hesselgrave, David, *Planting Churches Cross-Culturally: North America and Beyond*, 2nd ed. (Grand Rapids (MI): Baker Books, 2000), 74.

world!²⁰

As he summarizes the content of his book and describes the naturalness of churches birthing new churches, Hesselgraves writes,

Prayer for guidance ascended. Potential areas for a new work were surveyed and evaluated. Pioneer workers were selected and sent. Plans were carefully laid. Then contacts were made, the gospel was communicated, converts were won, believers were congregated, faith was confirmed, leadership was consecrated, the church was commended to the grace of God, and the missionary-evangelists were relocated. From the beginning it was in their hearts that, once established, the new churches would become the bases for the prayers, plans and participation essential to enter still other territories for Christ both at home and abroad. And so the Pauline Cycle has been and will be repeated, on and on, over and over, until Christ comes again and the church militant becomes the church triumphant.²¹

Melvin Hodges writes, “Self-propagation is the vital element of the missionary program. It is the true objective of the missionary endeavor. A church which does not propagate itself will soon die out. New Testament churches were self-propagating”²² Just like Hesselgrave, Hodges believes that laypeople’s involvement is vital for church propagation. First of all, every new believer should be a herald of the Gospel. Hodges maintains, “Converts are seed – gospel seed... Each convert is seed for a potential harvest. By nature, new converts are enthusiastic witnesses. Their vital experience with Christ has made them zealous to impart their newfound knowledge to others. Missionaries must learn to use that God-given zeal... It is vital that each convert be a soul winner.”²³ Quoting another missiologist, Hodges even recommends that zealous new converts who are winning souls not be replaced by trained workers: “The proper step is to encourage and teach the convert so that he can develop along the right lines. Roland Allen states, “We ought

20. Hesselgrave, 75.

21. Hesselgrave, 321.

22. Hodges, Melvin L., *The Indigenous Church*, 42.

23. Hodges, 42.

never to send a Mission agent to do what men are already doing on the spot spontaneously.””²⁴

Speaking to the Latin American context, Hodges believes that trained lay workers can also assist in the propagation of the church besides the new converts in the following fashion:

Perhaps one of the members who lived a considerable distance from the church opened his home for the preaching of the gospel. Or some unconverted person... may have desired meetings in his house. Instead of making these outstations the care of the missionary, the churches appoint their best qualified men to supervise them. They assign a certain lay worker to a given preaching point, making him responsible for that station for a period of time – perhaps for six months... The pastor visits these stations as he is able, but often the local workers carry on without help for weeks at a time.²⁵

Unlike Hesselgrave, Hodges does not seem to consider the possibility for the work of self-propagation to extend beyond the borders of the country where the initial mission work has been established. On the other hand, he describes how cities can be reached with the gospel.²⁶

Various views on training nationals

As is said in the second chapter of this thesis-project, it takes well-trained leaders to develop a national church that will withstand the passage of time. Wakatama voiced back in the 1970s what is still true in many developing world countries. He laments,

Because of the lack of trained clergy, many of the young people pouring out of African high schools and universities look down upon the church. Our poorly trained pastors are finding it harder and harder to minister, especially in the urban centers. They are struggling to minister effectively to congregations with growing numbers of government officials, lawyers, doctors, nurses, policemen, clerks, teachers and professionals of all kinds with overseas training when they themselves have had little academic and theological education.²⁷

He goes on to state, “If the lack of evangelical scholarship is not remedied, the church in Africa is going to be ill equipped to survive the next decade... It is faced with serious problems

24. Hodges, Melvin L., *The Indigenous Church*, 43.

25. Hodges, 44.

26. Hodges, 50.

27. Pius Wakatama, Pius, *Independence for the Third World Church*, 55.

that require not pat answers with Bible verses to match but serious study and thought.”²⁸ He suggests, “Since Christian training at higher levels is not available in Africa at present, deserving nationals should be assisted to study abroad.”²⁹ In a survey to which 21 Christian organizations answered, Wakatama discovered three prevailing general attitudes toward nationals studying in the United States. The position of most foreign mission organizations was hostile to the idea while national church leaders were by and large favorable to it. A middle-of-the-road approach championed the opinion that developing world pastoral prospects should study abroad only if the level they want to reach is not attainable in their own country or neighboring countries. Although Wakatama overzealously excoriates foreign missionaries – he affirms that “Americans are more jealous of the attainments of others than Africans or Asians will ever be” – this thesis-project is in basic agreement with his position, which he states as follows:

In order for them to adequately take over [nationals] need training at the highest levels that the missionary was trained. To say that nationals must be trained in their own countries is also unrealistic because much of the training that is needed at degree and postgraduate levels is not available in many countries of the Third World... Any mission or church still without a scholarship program for training their top national leadership is going to face serious problems soon. At the same time emphasis should be placed on providing the same training that is available overseas right at home within the cultural context of the Third World itself.³⁰

Melvin Hodges points to possible gaps in the training programs that are intended for national workers. He writes,

“First, there may be a gap between the intellectual development and the spiritual development of the worker. Too often we have trained the mind and have not been able to lead the student into the full life in the Holy Spirit. Second, there may be a gap between knowledge and practical ministry. We place the student in school and nurture him in a somewhat artificial climate. He is too far removed for too long a period of time

28. Wakatama, 59.

29. Wakatama, 65.

30. Wakatama, 79–82.

from the rugged life and problems which he is to meet in the ministry.³¹

Then Hodges pleads for the bridging of those gaps with the following suggestions among others: “First, we must provide for the spiritual development of our prospective workers as well as their intellectual development... Second, we must integrate our training program with the national church... Third, the workers should be trained to the task, not away from it! ... The New Testament approach is more along the line of on-the-job training. Jesus taught His disciples, but He took them with Him.”³²

What Hodges suggests goes right along with the triad: saintly hearts, Scripture-filled heads and skillful hands mentioned in chapter two of this thesis-project.

David Sills’ thoughts go pretty much in the same direction as Hodges’. Reflecting on the global situation of missions and evangelism, he writes, “Taking into account all that the Bible commands about discipleship and training, and how imbalanced the focus has become, the great tragedy of the world is not that it is unreached but that it is undisciplined.”³³ In the introduction of his book on training nationals effectively, Sills goes on to bemoan the current situation for people going into the ministry:

Seminaries once assumed that their students had received basic discipleship and demonstrated ministry gifts prior to coming to seminary and that ongoing discipleship and character development of the ministerial candidate was in place. In such cases they only needed to train him in the head knowledge, knowing that he would be apprenticed to a godly minister for training in ministry skills and application. Those days are sadly in the past.³⁴

In order to counter this state of affairs, the missiologist explains the method that Reaching and Teaching International Ministries, an organization that he leads, uses: “We train

31. Hodges, Melvin L., *The Indigenous Church*, 55.

32. Hodges, 59–60.

33. Sills, M. David, *Hearts, Heads, & Hands*, 1.

34. Sills, 11–12.

hearts, heads, and hands in an integrated fashion, constantly connecting personal discipleship to the content of traditional theological education and teaching practical pastoral ministry applications.”³⁵ More specifically this ministry offers 9 weeks of intensive training over the course of three years. Each week, the teaching consists in a mix of all the elements mentioned above according to a pre-established curriculum. The method is described as very effective and adaptable to a wide range of audiences regardless of the various academic levels of the learners.

Chapter 3 Summary and Conclusion

This chapter presents the varied and sometimes opposing views authors hold concerning the subject at hand in this thesis-project. The subtopic of self-support versus interdependence seems to engender the sharpest dissent among them, with some writers arguing for full-fledged independence and others forcefully advocating mutual support. Concerning the matter of self-governance, the viewpoint that has prevailed since the 19th century considers paternalism as a construct that must be dismissed and guarded against in missions. The third subtheme considered in Chapter 3 has to do with partnership. Here again opinions overwhelmingly favor the pursuit of some kind of relationship between mission and national church. Kopp recommends the family model over against the business model while Brynjolfson favors the partnership model as opposed to the sponsorship model. Then as relates to self-propagation, the importance of laypeople and new converts cannot be overstated. They, and not trained workers necessarily, should spearhead the evangelization efforts of the church. Finally on the topic of training nationals, Hodges and Sills concur that training students’ hearts is as important as preparing their heads.

Decades and even centuries of observation have taught us that in Christian missionary

35. Sills, 12.

circles, the pendulum swings sometimes toward paternalism, dependence and little or no training for nationals. However, when the pendulum swings toward overindulgence in helping nationals and they are showered with too much attention, they resemble butterflies that are doomed when they are helped out of their chrysalises. They become crippled. They can't stand on their own two feet. Missionaries must tread the fine line of giving nationals enough resources and opportunities on the one hand and letting them fend for their own future, on the other hand.

A healthy middle ground would consist in viewing nationals as partners who need to be adequately equipped to lead the church and parachurch ministries when missionaries depart, financially prepared to be self-sufficient, and highly motivated to grow within and beyond the reaches of their current ministries.

CHAPTER FOUR

CASE STUDIES ON READINESS OF MISSIONARY-TO-NATIONAL LEADERSHIP TRANSITION

In order to ascertain how western missionaries can entrust to Haitian nationals a work that is self-propagating, self-supporting and self-governing, this thesis-project proposes three case studies on three mission organizations. One of them has successfully transitioned to national leadership. It is the Union of Evangelical Baptists of Haiti. The other institutions have not achieved such a transition. Since the viewpoint of this thesis is not favorable to their situation, the name of the institutions will not be mentioned. Pseudonyms will be used. Key data has been purposely modified so the second and third organizations will not be readily identified.

Case study on the Union of Evangelical Baptists of Haiti (UEBH)

In order to obtain more information about the UEBH, the following questions were asked of the UEBH president under the form of a semi-structured interview. In other words, the answers to the questions that the interviewer prepares and asks the interviewee may naturally lead him to formulate additional questions that were not written ahead of time.

Questions for a semi-structured interview with the president of an organization that is self-propagating, self-supporting and self-governing

1. How did the transition happen between missionary and national leadership back in the 1970s?
2. Do you feel that the national leaders were ready to take over? Had they been well prepared enough by the missionaries?
3. How many foreign missionaries are still on the field? Do you feel they are indispensable? Can your organization fare well without the remaining missionaries?
4. What role has theological education played in the history of your organization and in its current situation?
5. How many presidents of your organization have gone through your Bible school?

6. Do you feel that the missionaries allowed you to have access to donors or did they think it was unhealthy for you to have outside support?
7. What is/was the relationship maintained with foreign donors?
8. Do you feel that foreign funds create unhealthy dependence on donors?
9. What parachurch ministries are you currently operating?
10. How are your parachurch ministries doing financially? Do they bring in needed income? Are they financial burdens instead?
11. What practices have worked best in terms of financial sustainability for parachurch organizations?
12. What is the education level of the leaders of parachurch organization leaders? Are they trained in the field in which they are currently working?
13. Is there a code of ethics for parachurch ministry leaders?
14. What is the best thing a foreign organization can do to help the nationals inherit a work that is self-propagating, self-supporting and self-governing?
15. Has your organization ever sent missionaries abroad? If so, how many? If not, when?

About UEBH

The Union of Evangelical Baptists of Haiti is a church association that is comprised of over 200 churches and some parachurch ministries, among them a hospital, a theological school, and a Christian bookstore. It was started in 1928 on Tortuga Island off the northwest coast of Haiti by missionary Alfred Pearce under the name Haytian Gospel Mission. Pierce served under the American Baptist Home Mission Society. In the mid 1940's this group was joined by several other churches and they merged and started the Mission of Evangelical Baptists of Haiti. In 1950 they started cooperating with Unevangelized Fields Mission. UFM (now Crossworld) "began as a faith mission in London in 1931, comprising missionaries formerly with Worldwide Evangelization Crusade."¹ According to their website, the vision of UEBH is that "every person, every community within our sphere of influence, will come to the knowledge of Jesus Christ and be transformed by an effective evangelical and social ministry through a network of dynamic and

1. Daniel G. Reid et al., *Concise Dictionary of Christianity in America* (Eugene, Oregon: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2002), 346.

united churches and institutions.”²

Still according to their website, “UEBH is a non-governmental organization that brings together churches, schools, medical institutions, and some community development projects, which aims to transform our society through the promotion of the spiritual, social, educational and economic growth of Haitians. The Union of Evangelical Baptists of Haiti (UEBH) is a religious, evangelical and Haitian association, Baptist and missionary in orientation, working for the transformation of communities in Haiti and abroad, to the glory of the living and true God, by:

- Evangelization
- The edification of its churches
- Christian Education
- The development of its institutions
- The establishment of social works and cooperative programs
- The promotion of its workers”

The current missionary population is comprised of two missionary couples and a single woman. In 1976-77 the transition was made to national leadership.

Some UEBH-affiliated institutions

Beraca Medical Center started as a dispensary in the 1940s. But “in the past 15 years, CMB has transitioned to being completely managed and operated by Haitian physicians, staff, and Board of Directors, while being self-sustaining for day-to-day operations”³ It is the best medical center for the Northwest region of Haiti not because it possesses cutting-edge technology but because of the hard-working people there. According to Dr. Jacques Louis, the President of UEBH, probably 75% of the staff are born-again Christians. Every year more people

2. “UEBH En Bref,” *Union Évangélique Baptiste d’Haïti*, June 2, 2016, accessed September 9, 2019, <http://uebh.org/uebh-en-bref/>.

3. <https://www.cmbhaiti.org> (accessed March 18, 2019).

come to faith in Christ through the ministry of this institution than any single church. The Evangelical Print House and Bookstore prints and sells Christian literature. They have produced and printed the most widely used hymnal in Haiti (*Chants d'Espérance*) for over 50 years. Most if not all employees are born-again believers.

Parachurch ministries are autonomous. They are run by their own administration and overseen by boards of governors except one or two. UEBH survives financially thanks to 7% of their income that its parachurch organizations share with the central administration and 5% of their income that churches are supposed to provide. Unfortunately not all churches do. If it were so, the Mission would be able to accomplish many more projects. All of this brings much needed income to the organization.

STEP (Port-au-Prince Evangelical Theological School)

This fourth chapter sharpens its focus on a particular institution considering its role in shaping UEBH. One of the assets that UEBH owns is the Port-au-Prince Evangelical Theological School (STEP). It has been in existence since 1942. More than 75 years later, STEP boasts of having trained hundreds of leaders who minister in Haiti and abroad as pastors, Bible school professors and denominational leaders as well as laymen and professionals. Most of the current pastoral leaders in churches and senior leaders of UEBH have received training from STEP. The school is well-known throughout the country as one of the best training centers for pastors. They offer a four-year bachelor's program. According to the President, STEP defines the theology of UEBH. In a transcript of minutes dating back to the 1940's, it was decided that no one should become a pastor without the approval of the Bible institute.⁴

4. Jacques Louis, "Interview with the President of UEBH," Personal communication, March 15, 2019.

Origin of STEP

Edner Jeanty writes the following about UEBH, “One of the strengths of this Mission is the importance they gave to biblical training. Toirac [the founder of the Bible school] believed that a good theological education was a priority.”⁵ He himself wrote,

Our firm conviction was that in order to rapidly evangelize the people and establish a solid work, it was necessary to give the nationals the best training possible. Giving mediocre training to national workers, who have had no traditional Christian heritage in their lives, is asking for trouble. Many national leaders have taken over works launched by missionaries without an adequate knowledge of the teachings of the Bible. Often this leads to false doctrines and many sad experiences have happened as a result. In the Great Commission the training for discipleship is as important as the evangelization itself.”⁶

Philosophy of STEP

The curriculum is patterned after those of most North American seminaries, with courses in three main areas: Bible, Systematic Theology and Practical Theology. STEP is premillennial and dispensational in theology. Its mission is “to train Haitian leaders to make disciples for Christ with a view to transforming their communities to the glory of God.” Besides,

The School will strive to instill in each student the spirit of excellence, strength of character, know-how and vision necessary to lead local churches to make a significant impact in their communities. These leaders will be able
... to preach and teach the word of God with skill,
... to serve local churches as pastors,
... to evangelize and make disciples,
... to address socio-cultural issues in the Haitian milieu, and
... to implement strong Christian education programs for the benefit of the churches.⁷

A board of governors oversees STEP. It is an autonomous institution that does its own fundraising and hires its own professors. In the past few years, the leaders of the school have emphasized the need for professors to disciple the students. One way this is encouraged is that

5. Jeanty, *Le Christianisme en Haïti*, 55.

6. Florent D. Toirac, *A Pioneer Missionary in the Twentieth Century* (Florent D. Toirac, n.d.), 391.

7. Séminaire de Théologie Évangélique de Port-au-Prince, “Prospectus 2013-2014,” 2013, 10.

the administration makes available some funds for professors to spend time with students doing ministry or just spending time together. Therefore the students develop their character and they sharpen their ministerial skills through conversation with, observation and imitation of the teacher.

This school has shaped most of the UEBH presidents. It sets the tone for theology and ethics throughout the organization. A few have completed graduate studies in US seminaries. Current President Jacques Louis confirms that training, both formal and informal, is a trademark of UEBH. Besides academic excellence, the school also encourages excellence in character. Starting in 2014, at the end of the school year, they not only give out prizes for good academic performance but also ask professors and students to nominate candidates for different prizes that reflect godliness of character. According to the Student Handbook, students receive the following awards each year.⁸

1. Sower Award: A student who shows faithfulness in evangelism or has witnessed about his faith in the Lord Jesus in exceptional circumstances.
2. Winner Award: A student who shows perseverance and who stayed at STEP despite exceptional family, financial or physical difficulties.
3. Servant's Heart Award: A student who shows an exceptional servant's heart, in accordance with the command and example of Christ.
4. Barnabas Leadership Award: A student who demonstrates an exceptional spirit of "servant leadership" by taking initiatives that are fruitful or by inspiring others to do good.
5. Daniel Integrity Award: A student who shows great integrity and exemplary seriousness in all areas of life.

Cheating, which is widespread at all levels of education in Haiti, is strictly prohibited and punished at the school, whose handbook states,

The Seminary considers cheating as thievery. In the unfortunate situation where a student is caught cheating during an exam, the teacher will cancel his exam, give him an F for the course and refer him to the Dean of Student Affairs for an official sanction ranging from suspension to final dismissal. This provision will also be applicable to any student who has facilitated cheating either by oral communication or by intentionally exposing his

8. Séminaire de Théologie Évangélique de Port-au-Prince, "Manuel de l'Étudiant," 2016, 18.

exam paper to his neighbor... In accordance with the teaching of Proverbs 28:13 (“Whoever conceals his transgressions will not prosper, but he who confesses and forsakes them will obtain mercy”), in cases involving a moral fault (cheating, plagiarism, sexual immorality, lying, etc.), to continue or resume his studies at STEP, the student must acknowledge his sin and clearly express his desire and decision to forsake it.⁹

STEP has played a key part in training nationals for UEBH and many other church organizations throughout the years.

Involvement in missions

UEBH supports on a monthly basis three missionary families that have been ministering in the neighboring Dominican Republic for more than 25 years. The churches take up offerings for them and the central administration makes up the difference. A Haitian family affiliated with UEBH churches went as missionaries to Zaire (now Democratic Republic of Congo) from 1994 to 1996. But they had to leave the country because of civil war.

A missionary-sending agency called Vision of Antioch was birthed among the ranks of STEP professors and graduates around 2006. Its purpose is to recruit Haitian missionaries to send them to West Africa, especially Senegal. The first Haitian couple who went there as permanent missionaries are STEP graduates.

This case study reveals that UEBH is an institution that has reached the status of self-propagation with a measure of self-missionizing, self-support and self-governance. As proof of that, it can be mentioned that churches are added to the association on a regular basis, that the impulse to establish the first Haitian mission board came within the UEBH, that the first missionary that they sent out was a STEP graduate, that only funds for special projects are sought outside the country, that missionaries are considered “participants” who accept UEBH’s leadership, and that church delegates sovereignly nominate and vote in UEBH’s executive

9. Séminaire de Théologie Évangélique de Port-au-Prince, 25, 30.

officers.

Case study of the Worldwide Evangelical Mission

The Worldwide Evangelical Mission (WEM, a pseudonym) stands in contrast to the UEBH as the following case study will reveal.

Below is the list of questions that were asked of the organization's leader in order to find information about the organization. Some of these questions were asked of one knowledgeable person within the framework of a semi-structured interview.

Questions for a semi-structured interview with a leader of an organization that is not self-propagating, self-supporting and self-governing as a whole

1. Has there ever been a transition between missionary and national leadership within your organization? If not, why?
2. Do you think the missionaries intend to let nationals fully take over the work some day? Explain your answer.
3. Do you feel that the national leaders are ready to take over if the missionaries were to leave on short notice?
4. How many foreign missionaries are still on the field? Do you feel they are indispensable? Can your organization fare well without the remaining missionaries?
5. What role has theological education played in the history of your organization and in its current situation? What is the level of theological education among national leaders?
6. How many presidents of your organization have gone through Bible school?
7. Do you feel that the missionaries allow you to have access to donors or do they think it's unhealthy for you to have outside support?
8. What are the expectations for national pastors to be ordained in your organization? To what standards are they held morally?
9. Do you feel that foreign funds create unhealthy dependence on donors?
10. What parachurch ministries is the national leadership currently operating?
11. How are your parachurch ministries doing financially? Do they bring in needed income? Are they financial burdens instead?
12. What is the education level of the leaders of parachurch organization leaders? Are they trained in the field in which they are currently working?
13. Is there a code of ethics for parachurch ministry leaders?
14. What is the best thing a foreign organization can do to help the nationals inherit a work that is self-propagating, self-supporting and self-governing?

15. Has your organization ever sent missionaries abroad? If so, how many? If not, when and why?

WEM was established in southeastern Haiti in the 1970s. They are unequivocal about their evangelical identity. Their main focus has always been winning souls, making disciples and building the church. WEM also has a wonderful record of contributing to human development as a whole. Through their various ministries they have provided healthcare and education to scores of Haitians. The deeply ingrained underdevelopment that held sway for decades in their main area of ministry has slowly given way to hope, literacy and other desirable outcomes of human development. They also made a significant impact in reforestation and farming, having taught farmers techniques to obtain improved harvests and fight against erosion.

Various parachurch institutions have taken shape under the influence and sponsorship of WEM. One of them is a hospital. The 20-bed establishment offers services in orthopedics, surgery, radiology, and pediatrics. An outpatient clinic, a maternity ward, a medical laboratory and a pharmacy also provide highly sought-after services to the neighboring community and even to patients who come from far away. WEM also runs a small gift store, which brings them some revenue and allows locals to earn some income by designing handicrafts sold through the store.

WEM's three-year Bible institute has trained pastors and workers for over 10 years. Students come mainly from WEM's network but also from other churches. Courses reflect the typical fourfold curriculum division in use in most traditional Bible schools: Bible, systematic theology, practical theology and general courses. After completing their studies students receive a diploma, which sets them on the course to become duly sworn pastors who can "marry and bury." The leaders of the church association have either gone through the school or attended renowned Bible schools in the country. They are the spiritual backbone of the mission among the

nationals. They watch over the spiritual wellbeing of the churches.

The septuagenarian founder has a strong personality and has been a real pioneer. In the mission's infancy he would travel long distances by foot or on horseback, sleep on dirt floors, and advocate for the development of his area of ministry with acquaintances, friends and government authorities. He is to many a father figure. Church workers cherish him for his many efforts to get churches started. Thanks to gifts from donors, around 65 churches have been built. Schools have sprung up alongside just about every church that was established.

WEM is a beacon in the community. It is appreciated by neighbors and visitors alike. Overt sin from nationals and missionaries that have links to the organization is dealt with. WEM's doctrinal stand is clearly expressed, and there has been no open deviation from orthodoxy and orthopraxy. Upon a closer look, however, some issues arise about the sustainability of the work of this good and otherwise reputable organization.

No transition in sight

There has never been a transition between foreign and national leadership for WEM. Current missionaries don't see themselves as coming alongside long enough to bring the fruit of their mission's labors to maturity, entrusting it to qualified workers and moving along to repeat the feat elsewhere. They seem to be there for the very long haul, that is until the Lord returns or they literally can no longer stay. The respondent disclosed that Haitian leaders "would like to make a strategic plan but he doesn't think they will succeed because the foreigners already have their own plans, their own road map." No nationals are being groomed for significant future leadership. Nobody knows of a calendar for a transition to happen either. In all likelihood this won't happen if their thinking doesn't change. Talks of turning the work over have sometimes

come up but only when financial difficulties have arisen. Administratively, the organization is under the control of a foreign board with whom locals have little or no contact. The nationals don't have a sense of ownership because they are only informed about the big decisions that the Board has made without consulting them or caring to inquire about their opinions. The gaping divide between missionaries and nationals must be bridged at some point if the organization is to become truly sustainable.

Financial opacity

The matter of survival without massive outside support is another concern. Donors from abroad support WEM's work and sponsor schoolchildren. But nationals have no knowledge of the benefactors' identity and maintain no relationship whatsoever with them. The mission organization holds tightly to the purse strings. Financial information is not shared. WEM's respondent affirms, "I have never known how much money the Mission gets per year or per month. There is no transparency. It's top secret." Of course not everyone needs to be informed about money matters. However, at least the top local leaders should be kept abreast of the financial situation. But nearly total financial opacity betrays a lack of trust and communicates to the nationals that they are outsiders. The underlying message that this policy conveys is that the nationals are "workers" so to speak and not the leaders, that they cannot be trusted or are incapable of managing finances. Thus they are at risk of becoming insensitive to the financial woes of the mission. The respondent revealed that national leaders sometimes say jokingly among themselves, "We didn't know when the funds were up, we don't care when they're down." If missionaries were to leave due to an emergency, how could the nationals be expected not to drop the baton, since they have no functional knowledge of the financial system?

Questionable self-support

All churches gather some income from tithes and offerings. But probably none is able to fully support their pastors or undertake capital projects, for instance. Pastors receive a monthly stipend from the mission. In some geographical areas, churches practice mutual support. Churches will come together and collect funds to give to a struggling congregation. But this is not widespread.

The foreign side of the organization has a basic structure in which a foreign director, under the leadership of a foreign Board, has the final say in all matters administrative and financial for most entities within the mission organization, even the church association. Early on a national church association was set up. It is made up of all WEM churches. The nationals lead the church association. It enjoys a certain level of autonomy. But they are financially dependent to a certain extent on foreign leadership because their budget is established jointly with the foreign leaders. Church leaders look up to the foreign leaders to help them fulfill some of their churches' needs. When facing unusual needs, church members and leaders alike revert to the default behavior of asking for money of the mission. Foreign directors are often frustrated by nationals' perception that the mission is a milk cow. But this mindset is the result of these policies and procedures. When asked whether he feels that foreign funds would create unhealthy dependence on donors if Haitians become leaders, the respondent remarked,

Considering the density of the work, considering the harsh places where most churches are located, considering the jobless rate and the intensifying of needs, outside support would be welcome. Yet, I would prefer it to be intermittent. Continual support would be welcome for continuous projects like schools, healthcare centers, vocational schools, etc.

No self-missionizing

As stated earlier, “self-missionizing,” the need felt by those who have been evangelized to take the Gospel beyond their borders, is an integral part of self-propagation. Although the number of WEN churches has multiplied within the country, there has been no known effort among the nationals to go to the end of the earth, as the Lord Jesus commissions. People within WEM’s constituency still consider themselves to be on the receiving end of the great commission. They likely don’t even realize that they, too, need to go. This is a patent failure to instill a biblical missiology and to disciple nationals as to how they also fit into God’s worldwide mission to reach the world with his kingdom.

Disturbing patterns

Trying to put a premium on employee competence, WEM leaders have not always ensured that the staff hired for key positions in different entities have made even a basic profession of faith in Jesus. Some employees have a shady reputation while still being in favor with the mission. In the past, some day school officials were well-known miscreants. Employees and people associated with WEN have resorted to theft, embezzlement, vociferous protests, and strikes to advance their interests or their desiderata. Some, it is rumored, have even availed themselves of folk magic. Unsaved staff members have misappropriated money and material resources to help build their own houses or repair their own vehicles. Pastors have misused the mission’s moneys to purchase property in their own names and have left the mission. The foreign leaders were sometimes naïve. Trusted nationals could have been involved in the hiring process, because they would have known or been able to detect character flaws better than the expatriates.

Over the years some nationals have felt that due to their lower social status or peasant

background, some missionaries have insinuated that they or their children ought not to pursue higher education but only technical or manual skills, which points to the fact that the expatriates did not always see the potential in the nationals and invest in their success. In some instances, people who are familiar with the situation perceive the tension between some expatriates and some nationals as the result of the latter getting more education than what the former had wished. It is probably untrue. Nevertheless the perception still exists.

All of this brings us to the conclusion that WEM is self-propagating, but only within the country. It is not self-supported nor self-governed.

Case Study on the Association of Christian Churches International and Gospel Churches for Christ¹⁰

The first case study reported on an organization that has completed its transition to national leadership with a measure of success. The second one considered a different organization that is far from accomplishing such a changeover. The following analysis concerns itself with a foreign mission agency and a group of Haitian churches that are effecting such a shift. For this case study, key information has been changed to preserve anonymity and privacy.

History

The Association of Christian Churches International (AACI) is a pseudonym for a mission agency that was originally founded in the U.S. with the intent of sending missionaries mainly to the African continent in the early 20th century. It is the first known independent mission board of its kind. What is the *raison d'être* of mission boards? Although they greatly vary in size, philosophy and methodology, many such agencies recruit missionaries, prepare

10. This case study is based on the author's personal observation.

them to go to the field and provide legal representation before foreign governments. All the stages mentioned are initiated after their local churches recognize and approve God's call on the future expatriates for the purpose of missionary work. Such entities offer various services to their constituents. Among others, they prepare missionaries for deputation, the practice most US missionaries adopt, and during which they present their ministry plans mostly to churches and individuals in order to raise financial and prayer support. Besides, agencies help manage finances as they receive funds from donors and allocate them among various accounts and subaccounts under the missionary's name. They send missionaries their salaries and manage their insurance policies and retirement funds. Mission boards also provide spiritual refreshment opportunities to missionaries on the field of service in the shape of retreats, Bible conferences and the like. Another value of being under a mission agency is group belongingness, knowing that one is part of a network made up of fellow missionaries and supporters who can be mobilized. All in all, the mission board is an undeniable fixture of the modern missionary movement.

Over its nearly 100 years of existence, ACCI has spread into more than 55 countries throughout the world. This mission board is a respectable organization. They are conservative in their beliefs and separatist in their practice. In this context, the word separatist means that they refrain from associating with religious organizations that are in disagreement with the fundamentals of the Christian faith. Many gems of spiritual victory adorn the pages of this agency's annals, like the conversion of tribal groups. Those pages are also stained with the blood of faithful martyrs both Westerners and Africans. And its history is punctuated by significant accomplishments, like the infiltration of the gospel behind the iron curtain, the founding of a still active Bible translation agency, the building of Bible schools and hospitals on mission fields, and the establishment of a perennial gospel witness among many people groups. Their beneficent

legacy will be felt for decades to come in many corners of the world if the Lord tarries.

Missionaries with this group of churches started their work in Haiti in the 1930s. As missionaries came, they settled in various parts of the country according to their felt calls. The work focused on church planting, training nationals and healthcare. Field council meetings were held periodically with all missionary families. During the 1980s, the missionary population was the highest. However, their numbers started decreasing in the 1990s. This happened as the missionaries going into retirement were not replaced. The predominating atmosphere was not inviting for newcomers as the widespread sociopolitical instability that rocks the country today (2019) was already rearing its ugly head. Some missionaries arranged smooth and biblical transitions in church leadership before they left. Others departed after family tragedy. However, no comprehensive strategy was articulated for the future of ACCI in the country. Currently, there are no foreign missionaries on the field.

Church planting was by far the endeavor toward which the biggest efforts converged in the 1980s. Several churches were established and their constituency strengthened in discipleship. Mainly under the impulse of national leadership a church association, Gospel Churches for Christ (GCC, a pseudonym), was started at the turn of the 21st century. It was comprised of the fewer than 20 ACCI-founded churches, and it opened its door for membership to other churches of like faith. The association is still growing as several churches have been either started by member churches or granted member status. Several day schools have been founded as a result of the churches gospel ministry. Missionaries also acquired land and property.

Theological and biblical training happened on a non-formal basis through a Bible institute that was not housed in a stationary facility. Only a handful of men benefited from the training, however. Not until the dawn of the 21st century was a summer Bible institute set up to

train lay leaders. A few years later, some of the remaining missionaries and the nationals founded a formal, degree-granting Bible school to train men for the pastoral ministry and any qualified born-again Christian desiring to know God better in order to serve him better within their sphere of influence.

A medical center and the accompanying infrastructure for housing nurses and guests were built in the 1970s. The center still provides quality care. The leadership and administration have now been turned over to the nationals. For various reasons, like the presence of another nearby state-sponsored center offering almost free healthcare and a lack of variety in services offered, the clinic's income has significantly decreased in the past few years. As this thesis-project purports, this decline coincided with the gradual departure and absence of the expatriates and the increasing responsibilities vested in nationals. The buildings are now decaying as funds are insufficient for the upkeep of the property and facilities. Unfortunately the nationals have not been trained in Christian stewardship and in fundraising. No board oversees the clinic's operation. A Certified Professional Business Coach who knows the situation of the clinic well is convinced that this healthcare center can earn the much-needed income to become self-sufficient if the right development plan is established and implemented. Such a plan would include offering patients a wider array of services and remodeling the facilities in order to attract more affluent patients. However, such a venture lies outside the scope of the current leaders' zone of comfort and competence, as evidenced by the inability to even establish a Board of governors. In fact, in 2009 Haitian American doctors decided to set up a 501c-3 in order to foster the development of the medical center. According to an e-mail, the philanthropic organization was to "initiate the project of upgrading the facility of [the medical center]. The focus will be to provide the needed medical health care to the population around that town. We will also take time to analyze and

propose other infrastructure improvement that will be needed to support [the medical center].”¹¹

But after the January 2010 earthquake that struck Haiti and the ensuing chaos, talks stopped, interest died away on both sides of the ocean, and the opportunity was lost altogether.

Now employees begrudgingly put up with their meager wages. A partial explanation to this situation is that in most missionary support systems, the support follows the missionary. When they leave the field, so does their support, even the percentage that is sometimes allotted directly to their ministry.

An agreement has been recently signed with a Haitian-run Christian charity in order to help the medical center get back on its feet financially, find new equipment and repair the run-down buildings. The effects of this partnership remain to be seen as no detailed planning has been developed between the two organizations yet.

Training makes a difference

One particular feature of ACCI and the churches associated with it in Haiti is that four promising young men had the opportunity throughout the 80s and 90s to study abroad thanks to scholarships from a US university. One of the conditions was that they would come back to their country after completing their studies and stay for a number of years. They all agreed and did come back to serve. They all have at least master’s degrees in theology, Bible or a related field. They all became pastors in their respective churches, and they have been at the helm of several fruitful endeavors within the Gospel Churches for Christ (GCC). All the churches they have pastored or are now pastoring are considered healthy churches by the evangelical community by and large. Two of them were heavily involved in setting up the GCC Bible School and are still involved in its administration. Two of them went on to become high-ranking officials in US-

11. Stan Michard, “First Meeting of [...] Improvement Project,” July 10, 2009.

based parachurch organizations while still serving in their ministries in Haiti. Three of them have become involved in a major, now 28-year-old, translation project of the Bible into Haitian Creole as translator, editor or chairman of the sponsor committee. Their ministry is untarnished until now, and they are highly respected as leaders.

Transition, seemingly an afterthought

With the number of missionaries enrolling with ACCI decreasing steadily and the prospect that there would be no more foreign missionary presence in the near future in Haiti, the leaders of ACCI started thinking up a transition plan whose aim was to turn over the work to the nationals in an orderly fashion. In the early 2000s the nationals were informed that ACCI wanted them to come up with a plan for their own future. The missionaries, they were told, would no longer be at the helm. ACCI administrators in the US had reconsidered their strategy for reaching Haiti. They desired ACCI to be a partner that would help nationals accomplish the goals they deemed worthy of pursuit. Haitian leaders met in the following months and articulated a vision for future ministry that included the following points:

- Godly churches furthering the kingdom of God on earth
- Comprehensive Christian education program helping build up the body of Christ
- Steady development program aiming at the welfare of all Haitians
- Purposeful diffusion of the word of God saturating society with Christian values

About four years later, a series of meetings were held between missionaries who were still on the field at the time, two ACCI officials, two national leaders and one of the former Haitian students, who had become an ACCI official. It was decided that one of the nationals who had studied abroad and was pastoring one of the GCC churches would become a missionary

along with his wife under ACCI in his own country. He would become the point man for achieving the transition to national leadership. As such, he would have to go through the regular process to become approved by the ACCI, go to missionary candidate school and start deputation in US-based churches. Once the needed support was reached, then he would slash his workload as a bivocational minister and get involved more deeply in the transition process, eventually leading to the nationals' receiving the legacy of ACCI. However, that plan has not worked as well as they thought it would. Because of heavy involvement in ministry and daily responsibilities, the national missionary has not been free to do deputation as most missionaries do. He does so once a year for a 15-day period. A formidable obstacle seems to be ACCI's substantial unpreparedness as an organization for a situation where a national living in his own country becomes a missionary. Little guidance and assistance has been provided to him as a citizen of a foreign country. Although individual missionaries have lent a helping hand and their contribution to deputation has been invaluable, ACCI as an organization has done little to help in this novel situation. Very little accountability concerning progress toward the specified goal has been required. All of this makes it seem like the transition process as it unfolds was an afterthought rather than a carefully planned succession of events requiring extra attention and support. Precious little has been accomplished for the past several years in the transition process as planned.

Failure on the nationals' side

As ACCI, the foreign mission agency, was preparing to do an official transition to the GCC, the national association of churches, was supposed to be making strides toward official recognition by the Ministry of Religious Affairs because it is still not a legally recognized entity.

That is one of the conditions for the transition to happen. The ACCI, as a legal entity, must entrust its assets and its legacy to another legal entity, which is GCC. However, the leaders of the local association have failed to take the necessary steps to make their organization a legal entity. They have been dogged by the neglect of their leaders. In particular, the head of the local association has become heavily involved in politics, making it difficult for the GCC to acquire legal status.

This is where things currently stand. The transition to national leadership is happening with mixed results. Although both the foreign mission board and the local church association have seen the need for handing the work over to the nationals, the transition process is trudging along, bringing forth mixed results. Both sides seem to have a fair share of responsibility in the current state of affairs.

Chapter 4 Summary

Chapter 4 helps discover a few facts. First, too few national leaders receive adequate training to take over the work. Second, national ministries are left to fend for themselves financially, without training in fundraising or donor contact information, while shouldering the crushing burden of paying newly hired indigenous workers' wages. Third, a technological gap cripples material progress due to the lack of proper knowledge and discipline in maintenance.

CHAPTER FIVE

SUMMARY AND FINDINGS

Summary of Chapter One

This thesis-project sought to discover how western missionaries can entrust their work to Haitian nationals so that it becomes self-propagating, self-supporting and self-governing. This question is grounded on the observation that in Haiti, after missionaries leave their field of service, their former ministries tend to disintegrate, as evidenced by at least one of the case studies. The matter under consideration is of vital importance for Haiti because more and more career missionaries are leaving the field and a new trend in mission circles promotes short-term service ranging from a few days to several months and usually no more than a year. Shortly and inevitably, mostly nationals will be in the driver's seat of their mission organization, leading the destiny of the work they inherit as the western missionary force in that area depletes.

It was established that the so-called "three-self concept" set forth by missions theoreticians Henry Venn and Rufus Anderson provides fair criteria for evaluating whether missionary labor has been truly successful in ensuring the transfer of the ministry to the nationals. Though simple in appearance, in this study 2 out of 3 organizations did not meet these benchmarks. First, efforts in self-propagation are often stifled by a lack of self-missionizing, that is evangelizing beyond the geographical confines of the indigenous group. Second, self-support is seldom attained because nationals are not purposefully and properly weaned from missionary support. Finally, paternalism may hinder self-governance if not kept at bay.

Three problems have been identified in this thesis that hamper a smooth transition of

responsibility to the national church. First, too few national leaders receive adequate training to take over the work. Second, national ministries are left to fend for themselves financially, without training in fundraising or donor contact information, while shouldering the crushing burden of paying newly hired indigenous workers' wages. Third, a technological gap cripples material progress due to the lack of proper knowledge and discipline in maintenance.

Summary of Chapter Two

The second chapter started with the assumption that missions is biblical. Then it was shown that self-propagation is biblical. The testimony of the Early Church attests that local assemblies started other churches and went beyond their borders to evangelize the lost. That was the case for two key churches – the church of Jerusalem and the church of Antioch. Self-government is the preferred biblical pattern for churches. They were to appoint their own leaders. Paul did not have the direct oversight of churches but he helped them appoint leaders into whose hands the work was entrusted. Self-support was also demonstrated to be biblical. Churches provided for the needs of their leaders and helped each other in case of need. They did not expect financial assistance from Jerusalem. In fact, non-Jewish Christians sent help for the believers in Judea while hunger raged there.

Harold Fuller depicts the missionary cycle observed in the book of Acts, as a memorable set of images. The missionary is first of all a pioneer, establishing the work. Then he becomes a parent, nurturing and equipping new converts for the ministry. Next he plays the role of a partner, working as an equal with trained nationals. Lastly, he intervenes only as a participant, helping the work grow when indigenous leaders occasionally call upon him to fulfill specific short-term tasks as a guest.

Chapter two, the theological backbone of the thesis-project, proceeded to demonstrate the emphatic need scripture places for properly chosen church leaders in view of the continuation of the work that has been established. 1 Timothy 3 and Titus 1 list the characteristics that such leaders should demonstrate. These criteria can be divided into 3 crucial areas: saintly hearts (loving God genuinely), scripture-filled heads (trained in Bible and theology) and skilled hands (mastery of the how-tos of the ministry). Non-pastoral leaders must also have good hearts that love God. But their heads and hands must be respectively filled with and skilled in the particular area in which they are laboring. One such example is found in the person of Bezaleel, the main artisan who built the Old Testament tabernacle and its furnishings (Exodus 35.30-35). He was rightly related to God thanks to the filling of the Spirit. He also had the head knowledge and the practical skills needed to perform the duty for which God had chosen him.

Summary of Chapter Three

The literature review chapter started by presenting the debate between supporters and opponents of self-support. Some, like Glenn Schwartz, argue that no money should be sent to ministries in non-western countries. Church members, they say, should learn to tithe in order to support the work. Others are of the opinion that western churches and Christians have the responsibility to share their overabundance with less fortunate brothers and sisters living in the developing world. Still others take a middle-of-the-road approach affirming that while churches should be self-supporting, parachurch ministries need gifts in order to survive.

The next topic that was considered in the literature review was self-government. Authors unanimously condemn the practice of paternalism and favor self-government. On the topic of

partnership, different models are contrasted. One such approach is the business model versus the family model. One significant difference between the two is that in the business model control is maintained with money whereas in the family model, which is preferred, relationships are supreme. Another enlightening comparison pits sponsorship against partnership. For example, while partnerships rest on equality, cooperation and trust, sponsorships foster hierarchy, domination and suspicion. Concerning self-propagation, all authors consulted agreed to its quintessential role in the success of missions and emphasize the role laypeople should play in propagating the church. The final topic that was researched in the literature review is that of training nationals. A developing world author insists that indigenous leaders must be trained at the highest levels that missionaries were trained. Melvin Hodges pleads for the spiritual as well as the intellectual formation of future church leaders. In the same vein, another author contends that leaders in training imperatively need to be discipled as they are receiving their formal education.

Summary of Chapter Four

The research method that was used in chapter four is a case study of three mission organizations that have reached different levels in the transition to national leadership. The purpose was to see whether the data support the researcher's hypothesis. The study of the UEBH revealed that it became indigenized after a purposeful transition with a foreign missionary organization over 40 years ago. Today this organization is self-propagating both inside and outside the country, self-supporting and fully self-governing. A few missionaries still cooperate with the organization, but their presence is not vital. Their parachurch ministries have a strong testimony for the Gospel. Thorough biblical and theological training is a hallmark of this

organization.

On the other hand, the study of Worldwide Evangelical Mission revealed a different picture. First, it is self-propagating only inside the country. Second, it is not self-supporting because there is a strong reliance on outside funds, which are controlled by current missionaries. Thirdly, WEN is not self-governing. It is true that an association of local churches is led by the nationals. But they must defer to the foreign field director for important decisions including finances.

Thirdly, the Association of Christian Churches International developed an exit plan only when the numbers of their missionaries began to decline dramatically. However, due to lack of preparation and vision on both sides, the transition process is still in progress and the final result is not yet established or apparent.

Findings

The way western missionaries can ensure that their work becomes self-propagating, self-supporting and self-governing is to establish at the outset an orderly exit plan while preparing nationals for spiritual leadership as well as administrative, physical and technical oversight of the ministry.

An exit plan

As the old adage goes, “failing to plan is planning to fail.”¹ The second case study revealed that Worldwide Evangelical Mission doesn’t have a plan for missionaries to leave the mission field. This is sadly true for other missionaries and mission organizations. However, as

1. “If You Fail To Prepare You Are Preparing To Fail – Quote Investigator,” n.d., accessed September 24, 2019, <https://quoteinvestigator.com/2018/07/08/plan/>.

the New Testament pattern reveals, missionary presence on a specific “field” had a deliberate time limit. Paul’s longest stay in one place was the three years he spent in Ephesus, as evidenced in his speech to the elders of that city. He reminded them that “for three years [he] did not cease night or day to admonish every one with tears” (Acts 20.31 ESV). Granted that Paul and his companions at times had to shorten their stays due to persecution, their sojourn never exceeded three years. They ordained leaders to continue the work. And they moved on to other cities.

The lesson for missionaries today is not that their time on the field should not exceed three years. It is, rather, that their time on a specific field has to come to an orderly end. By definition, the role of missionaries is temporary. This is not to say that they won’t be needed at a later stage. Paul himself returned to the churches he planted. But their goal should be to go elsewhere and start anew once the work is firmly established in the hands of nationals. Bob Scudieri is on target when he writes, “The missionary spends most of their time identifying and forming leaders [...] The missionary is very clear that their role is a temporary one; they will move on – like St. Paul, like Peter, like Jesus. The belief is that the Holy Spirit will raise up from the body of believers the ministers that are needed.”² Missionaries should work themselves out of a job. Therefore missionaries should have an exit plan, preferably from the start of their ministry on the field. That plan doesn’t have to include set dates because they will be tentative at best. But it may include set criteria indicating that the time has come to move on. Some may prefer to call this a transition plan instead of exit plan, since this is a transition to another ministry, if age and other circumstances permit. The rationale is that the missionary will need to seek God’s will as to where he will go next. If there is no such plan, the Pauline model cannot be reproduced. Even worse, sudden political unrest, social commotion or religious agitation

2. Dr Robert Scudieri, “The Need For A Missionary/Pastor on A Mission Field | Mission Nation Publishing Company,” n.d., accessed April 29, 2019, <https://missionnationpublishing.com/the-need-for-a-missionarypastor-on-a-mission-field/>.

sometimes causes missionaries to hastily retreat to their country of origin, forcing them to leave unprepared workers to care for the ministry.

As a result of the case studies conducted in this thesis work a self-study for expatriate mission-to-national leadership transfer is proposed below. The self-study is made up of 85 criteria that the researcher believes are important for a smooth transfer of leadership. These benchmarks are grouped around the following topics: mission philosophy, preparedness for future spiritual leadership, preparedness for future parachurch leadership, church readiness, parachurch readiness, and preparedness for financial transition.

Even a casual observer can't help but notice the significant contrasts between the three organizations that were described. In order to address such discrepancies and move toward a more sustainable philosophy of mission work, the following questionnaire for a self-study in view of a peaceful and orderly transition to national leadership is proposed.

This self-study is meant to suggest to those involved in an eventual missionary-to-national transition some objective criteria to evaluate their readiness. Each criterion is to be rated on a scale from 1 to 10, where 1 means totally inadequate or unsatisfactory and 10 totally adequate or satisfactory. This tool is not designed primarily to set a specific score that determines the level of transition readiness. The basic idea behind this guide is for the missionary to bring each low mark to where it is acceptable. It is highly advisable for the missionary to involve national leaders in this evaluation, especially in the areas where their feedback might be invaluable, like "Preparedness for future spiritual leadership" or "Church readiness." Eventually this exercise will help the locals better understand how they are faring and whether they are ready to be entrusted with the work. This guide need not be used only toward the end of the missionary's ministry. It can be beneficial if utilized a few years into his career in order to set

some goals with the nationals.

Table 3. Self-study for readiness of missionary-to-national leadership transition

Mission philosophy (Missions must be conducted according to New Testament principles.)

I believe with all my heart...

...that missionaries are called to move on when nationals are able to carry on the work themselves.	
...that when and if my work is done on one field, I will seek the Lord's will to go to another one, as the New Testament model indicates.	
...that I must write an exit strategy that includes an official and public handing over of the work to the nationals.	
...that I must encourage nationals to also go teach all nations.	
...that the nationals are every bit my equals in God's sight.	
...that the Holy Spirit can and will enable nationals to continue the work that a missionary has started.	
...that nationals must learn to depend on God and not on me.	
...that even if I started the work, it is ultimately God's, and I must relinquish it to the nationals once they are ready.	

Preparedness for future spiritual leadership (Future leaders must love God and men, be well-trained and capable of fulfilling pastoral tasks.)

Spiritual quotient: Future and current pastoral leaders...

...are humble and acknowledge that their potential comes from God.	
...readily submit to authority.	
...do not think it demeaning to perform manual work.	
...relate well with others.	
...perform well when working with others.	

...have a good reputation.	
...are well-liked by their neighbors.	
...are honest.	
...keep the promises they make.	
...love the word of God.	
...live what they preach.	
...are held in high esteem by their peers and the people.	
...have an orderly family life, loving their spouses and rearing their children in the fear of God.	
...control their temper.	
...practice spiritual disciplines (prayer, fasting, evangelism, etc.)	
...are not addicted to any substance.	
...are even-tempered.	
...are faithful in performing repetitive tasks.	
...are teachable.	
...know their areas of giftedness.	

Cognitive quotient: Future and current pastoral leaders...

...have received the best biblical and theological training possible.	
...have opportunities for formal and informal continuing education.	
...know the content of Scripture well.	
...are orthodox in their theology.	
...can exegete Scripture.	
...can defend the Christian faith.	

Practical quotient: Future and current pastoral leaders...

...foster right practices in churches (in worship, in church discipline, etc.).	
...handle Scripture skillfully in teaching and preaching.	
...counsel with competence.	
...know how to conduct public ceremonies.	
...lead the church properly with the help of elders and/or deacons.	

Preparedness for parachurch leadership (Parachurch leaders must have the highest possible preparation to receive the missionaries' legacy.)

Future and current parachurch leaders...

...have a saving knowledge of Christ.	
...have a deepening relationship with Christ.	
...are baptized and are faithfully serving in their local church.	
...readily submit to the word of God.	
...are humble and acknowledge that their potential comes from God.	
...are honest.	
...have a good reputation.	
...are highly qualified to do their job, having received the best possible training in their field of competence.	
...have opportunities for continuing education.	
...are loyal to their organization.	
...readily submit to authority.	
...respect coworkers and especially their subordinates.	

...do not think it demeaning to perform manual work.	
...speak the truth.	
...relate well with others.	
...affirm the benefits of team work.	
...perform well when working with others.	
...are well-liked by others.	

Church readiness (Churches should be ready to keep growing and flourishing.)

Churches...

...worship God in Spirit and in truth.	
...are financially self-sufficient.	
...have drafted foundational documents (statement of faith, Constitution, etc.) that they regularly refer to.	
...understand and practice biblical church discipline.	
...actively evangelize and look to obey the great commission.	
...multiply and grow spiritually.	
...train their workers to reach their highest potential.	
...establish leadership according to biblical guidelines.	
...are gathered in some form of association.	
...understand and apply the second great commandment through acts of compassion.	

Parachurch readiness (Parachurch ministries are sustainable and will continue to grow beyond their current size and capacities.)

Parachurch ministries...

...hold written foundational documents such as a procedures manual, a strategic plan, etc.	
--	--

...know that they exist to support the church.	
...know that they exist to further the Gospel.	
...have strong Christian leaders at their helm.	
...are led by self-perpetuating boards made up of faithful and competent born-again Christians.	
...hire Christians (with strong recommendations from their churches) especially upper echelon employees.	
...have access to donors and sponsors for projects.	
...know how to do fundraising internationally.	
...follow generally accepted practices of sound management.	
...are regularly reminded that their <i>raison d'être</i> is the furtherance of God's kingdom.	
...treat employees with respect and dignity and look out for their welfare.	
...have an <i>esprit de corps</i> approach to work.	
...understand the value of technical equipment and machinery and manage them well.	
...know how to get equipment maintained, repaired, ordered or purchased.	

Preparedness for financial transition (Making sure that financial resources won't dry up.)

Nationals must ensure that they...

...are adept at biblical financial stewardship.	
...are taught how to find funds for projects and parachurch needs.	
...have received increased responsibility over time for financial oversight.	
...have enough faithful, highly qualified and trained human resources to take proper care of finances.	

Money matters

Individual churches should be self-supported. They should be able to take care of their pastors and develop enough savings to undertake at least minor projects. However, in some areas poverty is such that outside money is needed to help pay pastors' salaries at least for a certain period.

K.P. Yohannan depicts the deep poverty of gospel workers in some parts of Asia using the following words, "The fact of the matter is that most growing churches in Asia are made up of people from the poor masses. Often they simply do not have money. These are people from among the one-fourth of the world's population who live on just a few dollars each week."³ That's why he feels he has the freedom to ask Westerners to "send financial and technical support to native evangelists and Bible teachers."⁴ A ministry called The Carpenter's Project provides financial support for a short time to gospel workers due to their great deprivation and the inroads that some support allows the gospel to make.

Some mercy ministries need no outside money. When enough income can be collected from services or products offered, then no outside help is needed. For example, a Christian bookstore or print shop may be able to generate enough income so as not to need outside support. However, some mercy ministries need help because the expenses they incur is greater than the income they may generate. This is the case for higher education or orphanages, for example. Having been the Academic Dean and interim President of a Bible school in Haiti, I know that Christian higher education institutions, which by definition are not for profit, cannot rely on tuition alone to cover their costs. They typically leave no stone unturned to make ends meet.

Finally the nationals should have access to foreign funds at least for special projects.

3. Yohannan, K.P., *Revolution in World Missions*, 207.

4. Yohannan, 77.

How can a million-dollar Bible school building be constructed in a poor country without outside help? How can children enjoy continued sponsorship without some outside help? Caution must be exercised. Churches must not depend on foreign funds, but some situations may warrant it, like when a church plant is getting established or a building project is underway. Also, parachurch ministries, more often than not, may need help. Bob Finley's words once again are a good guideline. According to him, "[m]ost local churches in America are self-supporting, as they should be in other countries. But there is no such thing as a self-supporting mission board, or Bible institute, or Scripture translation ministry or home for destitute children. All such parachurch ministries are dependent on the gifts of God's people for the continuation of their work."⁵

Spiritual leadership readiness

The national workers must be strong enough in the faith. They should have the highest training possible or available. The spiritual leadership must emphasize the great commission as the duty of the church.

D. Ray Davis sums up his thoughts about missionary exit with the following questions, "First, has the missionary task been carried out within the focus people or place? [...] Secondly, it must be determined whether newly established churches are outwardly focused. Are the new churches now in place seeking to reach out to new peoples? [...] Additionally, has the new church developed to such a degree that it owns the Great Commission task for itself?"⁶

As the contrast between the three case studies revealed, nationals don't always understand the need to reach others beyond their borders and may be inclined to perceive

5. Finley, *Reformation in Foreign Missions*. (Xulon Press, 2005).

6. D. Ray Davis, "The Missionary Task: Working Yourself out of a Job," *International Mission Board*, November 20, 2018, accessed May 1, 2019, <https://www.imb.org/2018/11/20/missionary-task-out-of-job/>.

themselves as being on the receiving end of the great commission. So the command to go to the ends of the earth must be encouraged and reinforced. They must be urged to join a global trend that has been documented as far back as the 1970s. In 1982, Lawrence E. Keyes wrote,

After nearly twelve months of in-depth research, the results indicate that Third World missionaries represent at least one-third of the North American full-time missionary force (excluding tentmakers and short-termers, in order to compare equals). [...] NonWestern [sic] missionary recruitment for full-time cross-cultural endeavor appears to be growing at least five times as fast as reported North American recruitment. [...] The Third World church is maturing, developing its own missiological methods and assuming its proper responsibility in world evangelization. It could be that this maturing force of missionaries might initiate the next great phase in missionary advance.⁷

Twenty-two years later, in 2004, the trend was confirmed according the following excerpt from the Lausanne Movement report.

The growth of the Majority World Church and its vitality have transformed it into a new missionary force. For example, The Nigeria Evangelical Mission Association (NEMA), founded in 1982, is formed by 90 missionary agencies and denominations and has more than 3800 missionaries in 38 countries. Indian Mission Association is connecting almost 200 national agencies and COMIBAM in Latin America is connecting 26 different countries in a mission movement. These agencies and churches today have some contributions to offer to the contemporary mission of the church.⁸

So-called “reverse missionaries” are another missiological novelty. They are described as “evangelists from former mission fields in Africa, Asia, and Latin America who believe their calling is to revitalize Christianity in the countries that first brought the religion to them. It’s a phenomenon that marks a shift in Christianity’s cultural center from the West to the so-called global South. By 2025, at least 50% of the world’s Christians will be in Africa, Latin America, and parts of Asia; in 1950, an estimated 80% of the world’s Christians were in Western

7. Lawrence E. Keyes, “Third World Missionaries: More and Better,” last modified October 1, 1982, accessed May 1, 2019, <https://missionexus.org/third-world-missionaries-more-and-better/>.

8. “The Two Thirds World Church (LOP 44),” *Lausanne Movement*, October 14, 2004, accessed May 1, 2019, <https://www.lausanne.org/content/lop/two-thirds-world-church-lop-44>.

countries.”⁹

Intellectual readiness

The research done for this thesis-project confirmed that academic knowledge is important for the work to prosper after missionaries leave. Parachurch ministries need qualified workers to lead them and keep them thriving. Whether they be school principals, teachers, nurses, surgeons, bookstore administrators, radio station managers or Bible school professors, the nationals need solid education. The same holds true for pastoral leaders. God places no premium on ignorance. Neither should we.

In order to explain the rather feeble impact Christianity has had in southern Asia as a whole and in India in particular, an author mentions a leadership crisis as one of the factors. He explains, “Until the Indian government imposed tighter controls on expatriate workers, sometimes even local leadership was in the hands of Westerners. Once they were gone, it was not always possible to fill their posts with properly trained nationals. In addition, [...] others have been attracted by parachurch organizations based in the West that offer better salaries than our local churches.”¹⁰

In other words, the crisis came as poorly trained nationals had no choice but to replace Westerners in parachurch organizations. Appropriate training would have prevented the crisis situation and Christianity certainly would have had greater clout and possibly more adherents.

9. Lily Kuo, “Africa’s ‘Reverse Missionaries’ Are Bringing Christianity Back to the United Kingdom,” *Quartz Africa*, accessed May 1, 2019, <https://qz.com/africa/1088489/africas-reverse-missionaries-are-trying-to-bring-christianity-back-to-the-united-kingdom/>.

10. Saphir P. Athyal, “Southern Asia,” in *Toward the Twenty-First Century in Christian Mission: Essays in Honor of Gerald H. Anderson, Director, Overseas Ministries Study Center, New Haven, Connecticut, Editor, International Bulletin of Missionary Research*, ed. James M. Phillips and Robert T. Coote (Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing, 1993), 57–68.

Practical and management readiness

Enterprises religious and secular rise and fall with management. Whether it is considered as a science or an art, management may be defined as “working with human, financial and physical resources to determine, interpret and achieve organizational objectives by performing the functions of planning, organizing, staffing leading and controlling.”¹¹ In order for nationals to carry on the ministry, they must be not only spiritually prepared and well-educated but also properly trained at the highest possible level to care for the human, financial material and immaterial resources that they inherit. Indigenous leaders need to learn techniques to conduct capital campaigns, for example. They should have access to the worldwide community of Christians in order to prosper financially and otherwise.

The difference between church planting and comprehensive missionary work

The practical steps that this thesis-project posits may seem to contradict some conclusions that missiologists have suggested regarding church planting. Church planting theoreticians usually adopt the three-self paradigm. Yet their conception on how to reach it may seem in contradiction with the approach proposed in this thesis-project. For example, Ott and Wilson describe 19th-century missionary John Nevius’s approach to church planting in China as follows, “First, churches should be entirely self-supporting and led by unpaid national lay workers. He found the practice of hiring young Chinese believers as evangelists counterproductive, as such workers lost credibility, often became mercenary, and created financial dependencies in the emerging churches. Second, only church methods and means for

11. Leon C. Megginson, Donald C. Mosley, and Paul H. Pietri, *Management: Concepts and Applications* (Harper & Row, 1989).

which local believers could take responsibility should be used.”¹² Later in their book Ott and Wilson present as a deterrent to church planting the fact of making church planting dependent on formally educated, paid church planters. They affirm, “Church-planting movements normally rely on bivocational lay, local church planters and on informal (modeling and mentoring) and nonformal (church-based training and workshops) training methods rather than formal institutional education.”¹³ Such practices may seem at odds with the concepts of nationals having access to some funding and being educated at the highest possible level, which are argued in this thesis-project.

However, at least three factors explain this apparent contradiction. First, the timeframe most often considered in church planting movements is the initial stages of the process of evangelization. The main objective is to make first-generation converts. Such a primordial effort does not require highly trained nationals or the sophistication that will be necessary to sustain the work during later stages. On the other hand, the missionaries or mission organizations considered here are those that have been established for some time and are considering relinquishing the leadership of the work to nationals. Second, church planting movements are primarily concerned with establishing churches, whereas mission organizations labor in a more diverse field of interests. Works of mercy often accompany the preaching of the gospel. Thus clinics, radio stations, Bible schools and other endeavors grow up in the churches’ tracks. Mere zealousness and sheer willingness will not keep these ventures afloat. Specialized training, technical knowledge and managerial know-how are musts if they are to survive. Third, church planting movements tend to widen the influence of the gospel, whereas long-term missionary work tends

12. Craig Ott and Gene Wilson, *Global Church Planting: Biblical Principles and Best Practices for Multiplication* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2011), accessed May 7, 2019.

13. Ott and Wilson, accessed May 7, 2019.

to deepen it. This is not a categorical statement, for the opposite is true to a certain extent. In other words, church planting also deepens the presence of the good news and missionary work also widens it. Yet, in church planting, as many congregations as possible are being established. Whereas the type of missionary work under consideration in this paper is one that tries to ensure that the culture of the gospel becomes ingrained and has an impact for generations to come.

The common thread: first heart then head

One of the findings in this thesis-project is the confirmation that in order for western mission work to exert a meaningful impact and be sustainable after expatriates leave, they must entrust it to people who fear God and have a heart for him, people who have been well-trained in the principles of God's word, whose minds are filled with and guided by Scripture. Whatever the stage of the transition process, the one pillar that holds the greatest promise to lead the locals after expatriates leave is always the group of scripture-equipped nationals who truly love God and fear him. It was the case for all three groups considered.

Conclusion

One of the most glorious scenes in all of Scripture is the great crowd described in Revelation by John as "a great multitude that no one could number, from every nation, from all tribes and peoples and languages, standing before the throne and before the Lamb, clothed in white robes, with palm branches in their hands" (Rev 7.9 ESV). It was then explained to the apostle that these people were "coming out of the great tribulation" (Rev 7.14 ESV). Eskimos, pygmies, Aboriginal Australians, Amerindians, Japanese, Haitians, Togolese, Canadians are all around the throne. All people groups are to be reached and a gospel testimony established in

their midst by the end times. If this is to happen, then it behooves Christian missionaries to ensure that their legacy will firmly endure and that those who receive the good news keep on scattering it all the way to the end of the world.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Allen, Roland. *Missionary Methods: St. Paul's or Ours*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1962.
- Anderson, Robert C. *The Effective Pastor: A Practical Guide to the Ministry*. Chicago: Moody Press, 1985.
- Athyal, Saphir P. "Southern Asia." In *Toward the Twenty-First Century in Christian Mission: Essays in Honor of Gerald H. Anderson, Director, Overseas Ministries Study Center, New Haven, Connecticut, Editor, International Bulletin of Missionary Research*, edited by James M. Phillips and Robert T. Coote, 57–68. Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing, 1993.
- Barrick, Bill. "How Can Mission Churches Be Self-Supporting? | The Master's Academy International." *The Master's Academy International*. Last modified December 22, 2017. Accessed September 2, 2019. <https://www.tmai.org/how-can-mission-churches-be-self-supporting/>.
- Berger, John E. "Information about Crossworld Missionaries in Haiti," May 1, 2018.
- Blue, Ronald. *Evangelism and Mission: Strategies for Outreach in the 21st Century*. Thomas Nelson, 2001.
- Brynjolfson, Rob. "From Synthesis to Synergy: The Iguassu Think Tanks." In *Global Missiology for the 21st Century: The Iguassu Dialogue*, edited by William D. Taylor, 477–88. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2000.
- Carter, John F. "The Indigenous Principle Revisited: Towards a Coactive Model of Missionary Ministry," January 1998.
- Davis, D. Ray. "The Missionary Task: Working Yourself out of a Job." *International Mission Board*, November 20, 2018. Accessed May 1, 2019. <https://www.imb.org/2018/11/20/missionary-task-out-of-job/>.
- Dodge, Anne Elizabeth. "A Historical and Analytical Overview of North American Protestant Missions in Zimbabwe: 1890-1987." Yale Divinity School, Yale University, 1987.
- Downs, Fred S. "Mission Boards and Indigenous Churches." *Occasional Bulletin from the Missionary research Library* XIX, no. 3 (March 1968): 9.
- Easter, John L. "The Indigenous Church: Advancing Our Missions Strategy for the Next 100 Years." *Enrichment Journal* (April 2014). Accessed February 2, 2019. http://enrichmentjournal.ag.org/201404/201404_086_Indigenous_Church.cfm.
- Finley, Bob. *Reformation in Foreign Missions*. Xulon Press, 2005.
- . "Send Dollars and Sense: Why Giving Is Often Better than Going." *Christianity Today*, no. October 4 (1999): 73–75.

- Franklin, Kirk, and Nelus Niemandt. "Funding God's Mission - Towards a Missiology of Generosity." *Missionalia: Southern African Journal of Mission* 43, no. 3 (2015): 384-409.
- Guthrie, Donald. *The Pastoral Epistles*. 2nd edition. Tyndale New Testament Commentaries. Leicester: Inter-Varsity Press, 1990.
- Hale, Thomas. *On Being a Missionary*. William Carey Library, 1995.
- Hesselgrave, David. *Planting Churches Cross-Culturally: North America and Beyond*. 2nd ed. Grand Rapids (MI): Baker Books, 2000.
- Hodges, Melvin L. *The Indigenous Church*. Springfield (MO): Gospel Publishing House, 1976.
- Horevay, Joseph. "Shortsightedness And The Purposes Of God | NEO House Church Network." Accessed April 6, 2020. <http://www.neohcn.org/resources/articles/shortsightedness-and-the-purposes-of-god>.
- James, Orr. *The International Standard Bible Encyclopedia*. Delmarva Publications, Inc., 2018.
- Jeanty, Edner A. *Le Christianisme en Haïti*. Bloomington, Indiana: AuthorHouse, 2011.
- Johnson, Andy. *Missions: How the Local Church Goes Global*. Crossway Books, 2017. Accessed November 12, 2018. <https://www.scribd.com/book/356264802/Missions-How-the-Local-Church-Goes-Global>.
- Kent, Homer. *Les Épîtres pastorales: Étude des première et deuxième épîtres à Timothée, et de l'épître à Tite*. Trois-Rivières (Canada): Impact, 1981.
- Keyes, Lawrence E. "Third World Missionaries: More and Better." Last modified October 1, 1982. Accessed May 1, 2019. <https://missionexus.org/third-world-missionaries-more-and-better/>.
- Kool, Anne-Marie. "What Has Been Achieved in 25 Years of Eastern European Mission?" Bucharest, 2014. Accessed February 25, 2019. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/304213062_Revolutions_in_European_mission_What_has_been_achieved_in_25_years_of_Eastern_European_Mission.
- Kopp, Thomas J. "Church and Mission: Decolonizing the Mind." *Evangelical Review of Theology* 28, no. 3 (July 2004): 255-.
- Kroll, Woodrow. *The Vanishing Ministry in the 21st Century: Calling a New Generation to Lifetime Service*. Grand Rapids: Kregel, 2002.
- Kuo, Lily. "Africa's 'Reverse Missionaries' Are Bringing Christianity Back to the United Kingdom." *Quartz Africa*. Accessed May 1, 2019. <https://qz.com/africa/1088489/africas-reverse-missionaries-are-trying-to-bring-christianity-back-to-the-united-kingdom/>.
- Louis, Jacques. "Interview with the President of UEBH." Personal communication, March 15, 2019.
- McLachlan, Douglas R. *Thirsting for Authenticity: Calling the Church to Robust Christianity*. St. Michael, MN: Reference Point, 2017.

- Megginson, Leon C., Donald C. Mosley, and Paul H. Pietri. *Management: Concepts and Applications*. Harper & Row, 1989.
- Michard, Stan. "First Meeting of [...] Improvement Project," July 10, 2009.
- Neumann, Mikel. "Paternalism." *Evangelical Dictionary of World Missions*. Baker Books, 2000.
http://www.cycledoctoralfactec.com/uploads/7/9/0/7/7907144/evangelical_dictionary_of_world_mission.pdf.
- Ott, Craig, and Gene Wilson. *Global Church Planting: Biblical Principles and Best Practices for Multiplication*. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2011. Accessed May 7, 2019.
<https://books.google.ht/books?id=9fJ8ucdqg6IC&pg=PT72&dq=Nevius,+John.+1958.+Planting+and+Development+of+Missionary+Churches.&hl=en&sa=X&ved=0ahUKEwiPjZaBl4fiAhUDr1kKHfYpCS0Q6wEINzAD#v=onepage&q=Nevius%2C%20John.%201958.%20Planting%20and%20Development%20of%20Missionary%20Churches.&f=false>.
- Ramsay, William M. *St. Paul: The Traveler and the Roman Citizen*. Edited by Mark Wilson. Grand Rapids: Kregel, 2001.
- Reese, Robert. "The Surprising Relevance of the Three-Self Formula," no. July-August. *Mission Frontiers* (2007): 25–27.
- Reid, Daniel G., Robert D. Linder, Bruce Shelley, Harry S. Stout, and Craig A. Noll. *Concise Dictionary of Christianity in America*. Eugene, Oregon: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2002.
- Rickett, Daniel. *Building Strategic Relationships: A Practical Guide to Partnering with Non-Western Missions*. 3rd ed. Orlando (FL): Stem Press, 2008.
- Rickett, Daniel. "Walk with Me (Part 2): The Path to Interdependency" (n.d.): 9.
- Rowell, John. *To Give or Not to Give?: Rethinking Dependency, Restoring Generosity, and Redefining Sustainability*. Tyrone (GA): Authentic Publishing, 2006.
- Schwartz, Glenn J. "Is There a Cure for Dependency among Mission-Established Churches." *World Mission Associates* (July 2000).
- Scudieri, Dr Robert. "The Need For A Missionary/Pastor on A Mission Field | Mission Nation Publishing Company," n.d. Accessed April 29, 2019. <https://missionnationpublishing.com/the-need-for-a-missionarypastor-on-a-mission-field/>.
- Séminaire de Théologie Évangélique de Port-au-Prince. "Manuel de l'Étudiant," 2016.
- . "Prospectus 2013-2014," 2013.
- Shenk, Wilbert R. *Henry Venn--Missionary Statesman: Missionary Statesman*. Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2006.
- Shenk, Wilbert R. "The Contribution of Henry Venn to Mission Thought." *Anvil* 2, no. 1 (1985): 25–42.
- Sills, M. David. *Hearts, Heads & Hands: A Manual for Teaching Others to Teach Others*. Nashville, TN: B&H Publishing Group, 2016.

- Thayer, Joseph Henry. *The New Thayer's Greek-English Lexicon of the New Testament*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1981.
- The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica. "Technology." *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, n.d. <https://www.britannica.com/technology/technology>.
- Tippett, Alan Richard. *Introduction to Missiology*. Pasadena (CA): William Carey Library, 1987.
- Toirac, Florent D. *A Pioneer Missionary in the Twentieth Century*. Florent D. Toirac, n.d.
- Wakatama, Pius. *Independence for the Third World Church: An African's Perspective on Missionary Work*. Downers Grove, Illinois: InterVarsity Press, 1976.
- Whiteman, Darrell L. "Anthropology and Mission: The Incarnational Connection." In *Mission & Culture: The Louis J. Luzbetak Lectures*, 59–98. The American Society of Missiology 48. Maryknoll (NY): Orbis Books, 2012.
- Winter, Ralph D. "Four Men, Three Eras, Two Transitions: Modern Missions." In *Foundations of the World Christian Movement: A Larger Perspective*, edited by Ralph D. Winter. Pasadena (CA): Institute of International Studies, 2008. <https://books.google.ht/books?id=aTGyXTMr3ZUC&pg=PA285&lpg=PA285&dq=ralph+winter+Lucky+is+the+missionary+in+whose+own+career+this+whole+sequence+of+stages+takes+place&source=bl&ots=5Sfx1PKBlh&sig=ACfU3U15aozoqUnSjMo6CU0uOTZwYS2xRw&hl=en&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwiuwYf468TiAhVOW1kKHc-ADfoQ6AEwAXoECAkQAQ#v=onepage&q=ralph%20winter%20Lucky%20is%20the%20missionary%20in%20whose%20own%20career%20this%20whole%20sequence%20of%20stages%20takes%20place&f=false>.
- Wright, Christopher J. H. *The Mission of God: Unlocking the Bible's Grand Narrative*. Downers Grove, Illinois: InterVarsity Press, 2006.
- Yohannan, K.P. *Revolution in World Missions*. Carrollton (TX): gfa books, 2003.
- "If You Fail To Prepare You Are Preparing To Fail – Quote Investigator," n.d. Accessed September 24, 2019. <https://quoteinvestigator.com/2018/07/08/plan/>.
- "Inns and Innkeeping | Resources | American Bible Society." *American Bible Society Resources*. Accessed May 31, 2019. <http://bibleresources.americanbible.org/resource/inns-and-innkeeping>.
- "The Two Thirds World Church (LOP 44)." *Lausanne Movement*, October 14, 2004. Accessed May 1, 2019. <https://www.lausanne.org/content/lop/two-thirds-world-church-lop-44>.
- "UEBH En Bref." *Union Évangélique Baptiste d'Haïti*, June 2, 2016. Accessed September 9, 2019. <http://uebh.org/uebh-en-bref/>.

VITA

Jean Maxime Pierre-Pierre
Born in Port-au-Prince, Haiti, on February 15, 1969

EDUCATION

Graduated as class valedictorian (May 1994) with Master of Arts in Bible at Bob Jones University, Greenville South Carolina.

Graduated *Magna cum Laude* (May 1992) with Bachelor of Arts in Bible Education (minor in History) at Bob Jones University, Greenville South Carolina.

ACADEMIC EMPLOYMENT

Professor of Homiletics at *Séminaire de Théologie Évangélique de Port-au-Prince*, September 1999 – present.

Professor of Oral Communication at *Séminaire de Théologie Évangélique de Port-au-Prince*, September 1998 – present.

SOME PUBLICATIONS

Pierre-Pierre, Maxime, « Cri d'alarme contre l'œcuménisme », *Scriptura*, Volume 2, Séminaire de Théologie Évangélique de Port-au-Prince, 2002.

Pierre-Pierre, Maxime, « L'enseignement de l'homilétique », *Dictionnaire de Théologie Pratique*. Christophe Paya and Bernard Huck, editors. Excelsis, 2011.

PRESENTATION AT PROFESSIONAL MEETINGS

Theological Education Engaging Culture, Caribbean Evangelical Theological Association, Trinidad and Tobago, 2003.

OTHER

Years of D.Min. Work: 2012-2020

Doctor of Ministry in education: May 2020